

Mutual Accountability of All Parties

Contents

Executive Summary	3
Introduction and Overview	7
Citywide and Regional Collaborative Efforts	8
Problem-Solving Education and Engagement	21
Oversight and Auditing	24
Evaluation Protocol	26

Appendices

Appendix A – Buildings & Inspections summary	
Appendix B – Community & Economic Development summary	
Appendix C – Fire Department summary	
Appendix D – Health Department summary	
Appendix E – Public Services summary	
Appendix F – Recreation Commission summary	
Appendix G – Transportation & Engineering summary	
Appendix H – PIVOT summary	
Appendix I – PSTS Audit	
Appendix J – Criminal Justice/ Community Professionals Survey	
Appendix K – Police Officer Survey	
Appendix L – Office of Human Relations summary	

Appendix M – City Manager’s Advisory Group agendas

Appendix N – Office of Performance & Data Analytics summary

Appendix O – Civil Service Commission, Rule 10: Promotions

Appendix P – Police Recruit Disqualifying Criteria

Appendix Q – CPD Procedure 13.110

Appendix R – CPD Procedure 13.112

Appendix S – CPD Form 77, Sworn Assignment Application

Executive Summary

The second report for the Collaborative Agreement (the Agreement) refresh process has been completed by the Cincinnati Police Department (CPD). This report outlines progress relative to the mutual accountability provisions contained in the Agreement. Paragraph 30 of the Agreement captures the goal of the mutual accountability provisions:

The Parties, in consultation with appropriate experts and under the supervision of the Monitor, shall develop a system of evaluation to track the attainment of goals agreed to between the Parties in the Settlement Agreement. This tracking enables the Agreement to serve as a mutual accountability plan. The term “mutual accountability plan” is defined as a plan that ensures that the conduct of the City, the police administration, members of the Cincinnati Police Department and members of the general public are closely monitored so that the favorable and unfavorable conduct of all is fully documented and thereby available as a tool for improving police-community relations under this Agreement. The Parties will regularly meet with the Monitor to study the results of the evaluation instruments and determine what changes, if any, in the Agreement or in their actions should be pursued in light of the evaluation results. That system shall also include a plan for determining what parts of this evaluation oversight may be transferred from the Monitor’s supervision to a successor agency before this Agreement expires in order that ongoing evaluation efforts of police-community relations continue.

During the formal oversight period for the Agreement, the Parties were assisted with this process through an evaluation protocol developed by an outside contractor (RAND) with involvement and input from the Monitor. This protocol implemented a number of processes designed to elicit the data necessary to render an opinion as to the quality of interaction between police and the community:

- 1) Periodic surveys;
- 2) Periodic observations of programs in which the police are involved;
- 3) Annual statistical compilations of police interactions with the community and the community’s interactions with the police.

Although assistance from the Monitor and contractor ended upon the conclusion of the formal oversight period, the City filled this void through the formation of the City Manager’s Advisory Group (MAG). This group of City and community representatives was formed to address community concerns, continue the reforms commenced under the Agreement, and assess the efforts of the community to improve police-community relations. Regular meetings are held on a quarterly basis and include presentations and discussions about crime statistics, problem-solving initiatives, and community concerns or issues.

In addition to utilizing the guidance provided by MAG, CPD has developed beneficial partnerships with several local academic colleagues and taken advantage of research opportunities to examine and implement the best of policing industry standards. At the same time, the City of Cincinnati enhanced management accountability and structure throughout the organization by developing the Office of Performance and Data Analytics. The resulting improvements are built to be sustainable and to cultivate an environment conducive to rapid growth and innovation.

As we have recently seen on a national level, there is a growing public outcry for alternatives to traditional policing approaches. Fortunately, the Collaborative Agreement assisted CPD and the Cincinnati community to understand and embrace this notion a number of years ago. Keeping in mind that core policing services are still a large part of the workload, the CPD has organized service delivery accordingly to accomplish three major priorities:

- I. Core Services
- II. Targeted Enforcement and Outreach Services
- III. Support Services

I. Core Services

As with any large police agency, the core services are generated by the needs of the public. These duties include responding to calls for service, reporting and investigating incidents of crime, and traffic enforcement, mobility, and accident investigations.

II. Targeted Enforcement and Outreach Strategies

As suggested by Dr. Jon Eck and adopted by CPD, crime and disorder can be best addressed by understanding the elements of the problem analysis (crime) triangle. The crime triangle provides a way to consider recurring problems of crime and disorder; it contends that crime and/or disorder is the result of 1) likely suspects and 2) suitable victims coming together at a 3) place which allows or fosters the resulting event. Building on this model, CPD has implemented and committed to specific strategies we feel can impact each of these three elements:

1. Cincinnati Initiative to Reduce Violence (CIRV) – Although the program has evolved since its inception, the initiative seeks to identify those individuals and their respective criminal networks having the greatest capacity to orchestrate violent crime in our community. Once identified, the various agencies involved in CIRV attempt to mitigate the individuals ability to commit any future acts of violence.
2. Place-Based Investigations of Violent Offender Territories (PIVOT) – There is no question there are places that influence, attract or otherwise support criminal activities. But CPD has found that similar to criminally prone individuals, networks of places can greatly influence crime and disorder. CPD's PIVOT strategy has been put in place to identify and study the impact of placed based networks. Strategies are then developed to reduce the adverse impact they are having on their respective communities.
3. Community Sustainability and Rebuilding – Once conditions in the community are stabilized, sustainability is often dependent on community rebuilding and strategic planning. In some instances, the culture of the community must change to incorporate community guardians, mentors and gatekeepers. Community anchor points must be established by leveraging investment and clean up. And preventing another generation's exposure to crime must be mitigated by community youth strategies and messaging.

III. Support Services

Although the first two legs of the CPD strategy receive the greatest public attention and scrutiny, these services could not happen without necessary support services. This support is not just limited to units internal to CPD but extend across the entire spectrum of City government. At a minimum, these functions would include management, budgeting, training, equipment, legal, personnel, technical and maintenance services.

CPD believes its interaction with its stakeholders continues to proceed in a positive and very productive direction. This is the result of huge dedication on the part of the City as well as the communities we serve. City Administration has made our commitment to the Agreement expand across the entire spectrum of City government. At the same time, we have seen tremendous support and work in our neighborhoods which have brought about great change. While we recognize there is always room for growth and improvement, CPD and the City is eager to continue the progress we have made and committed to build upon our successes.

Introduction and Overview

The City of Cincinnati is committed to continue the progress realized during the implementation of the Collaborative Agreement (CA). To reaffirm this commitment, the City determined an internal review be conducted to evaluate the City's compliance and status with regard to pivotal provisions of the CA. The Cincinnati Police Department (CPD) was designated to coordinate the project and compile the evaluation reports for the City. The ultimate goal is for the City and stakeholders to develop a more practical and relevant action plan which supports the spirit of the CA and promotes continuous progress for community-police relations.

The Collaborative Agreement was designed to enable and encourage all of the participating Parties to contribute to its ongoing implementation and benefit from its accomplishments. Dialogue which engaged the entire community resulted in a commitment by all to promote and foster cooperation between the police and the Parties. A primary responsibility of all of the Parties was to adopt and practice a problem-solving philosophy to address quality of life and crime issues affecting Cincinnati neighborhoods.

"Mutual Accountability of All Parties" is the second evaluation report in a series of three. This report summarizes the City's internal review of the engagement level of other entities in attaining the goals and continuing the success of the CA, including:

- Availability and participation of other City of Cincinnati departments
- Coordination with other law enforcement agencies in problem-solving efforts
- Education and/or materials provided to public officials and the community reference problem-solving and policing philosophy
- Level of engagement of public officials, stakeholders and the community in problem-solving projects
- The oversight process by the City Manager's Advisory Group (MAG)
- Evaluation Protocol
- CPD Staffing practices

Citywide and Regional Collaborative Efforts

Introduction

Although the Collaborative Agreement envisioned CPD as the primary City agency to fulfill its directives, the City has gone beyond expectations by integrating CA principles into aspects of most City services and departments. Since adopting the problem-solving philosophy, City departments have worked cooperatively with each other and community members on many small and large-scale neighborhood projects. For purposes of the *Mutual Accountability* review, the City Manager requested department directors provide submissions highlighting some of their contributions and/or significant projects they have initiated or been involved in during the past several years. Some of the larger-scale projects involve multiple City departments, and were included in several submissions. In an effort to reduce redundancy, this section includes abbreviated summaries of the reports, with the originals included as appendices. Other participating City departments are also listed, when known.

City Department Participation

Buildings & Inspections

The Department of Buildings and Inspections (B&I) is tasked with developing and maintaining the quality of City properties through the enforcement of established building and zoning codes. Consequently, B&I actively leads and/or participates in many citywide problem-solving projects. *Appendix A* highlights four of the more extensive, ongoing efforts B&I staff have been involved with, including the following two:

1. **Neighborhood Enhancement Program (NEP)** – This citywide program has been in existence since 2007 and is currently concentrating on Cincinnati’s “West End” neighborhood, the 24th community to participate in the program. The NEP is a 90-day collaborative effort between City departments, neighborhood residents and community organizations to improve quality of life and develop neighborhood assets by strategically deploying public resources. The targeted areas are identified through an

analysis of drug and disorder calls for service and arrests, building code violations, litter and weeds, junk autos, and vacant buildings.

The NEP has won several awards since its inception:

- Best Program of the Year – Physical Revitalization; Neighborhoods USA, 2008
- President’s Award; Ohio Conference for Community Development, 2008
- Most Outstanding Collaborative Effort; Community Development Corporations Association of Greater Cincinnati, 2009
- Program Excellence in Community Partnership; Ohio City Manager’s Association, 2009
- National Finalist (Community Development); National Development Council Academy, 2009

Additional Participating City Departments:

- *City Planning*
- *Community & Economic Development*
- *Fire*
- *Health*
- *Law*
- *Police*
- *Public Services*
- *Recreation Commission*
- *Transportation & Engineering*

2. **Collaboration with Communities United for Action (CUFA)** – B&I has been working closely with CUFA for several years to identify and address crucial vacant buildings causing the most harm in each community. Once identified, community leaders, citizens and B&I staff work together to develop and carry out either renovation plans or if beyond repair, demolition. Since 2015, a total of 45 vacant or blighted buildings have been closed through either repairs or demolition.

Additional City Departments Working with CUFA:

- *Office of Environment & Sustainability*
- *Health*
- *Human Resources*
- *Recreation Commission*

Community & Economic Development

The mission of the Department of Community and Economic Development (DCED) is to facilitate strategic development and services within the Cincinnati community that improve the lives of residents, increase business investment, and revitalize City neighborhoods. DCED is involved in numerous citywide, collaborative projects. The following summarizes two of the four efforts detailed in *Appendix B*:

- 1. Strategic Partnerships Advancing Redevelopment in Communities (SPARC) –**
The SPARC program was developed to provide focused resources and technical assistance to local Community Development Corporations (CDCs) to improve their ability to provide adequate housing units that meet the needs of their neighborhood. When SPARC debuted in 2015, it was envisioned as a 15-month / 3 phase program, with the neighborhood of Avondale designated for the pilot project. As with all new concepts, SPARC experienced various successes and challenges during the pilot program. Valuable lessons and “best practices” realized during the initial pilot program are utilized while planning future SPARC projects. The DCED is currently involved in a SPARC program in the Kennedy Heights neighborhood.
- 2. Youth to Work Consortium (Y2WK) –** The Y2WK Consortium is part of the City’s Summer Youth Employment Program, and was established in 2014 to develop a systematic approach to employing and optimizing the work experience of area youth, ages 14 – 17. The Consortium fosters academic, personal and professional growth by providing real-world work experience and networking opportunities to the participants. Students gain life and work skills through internships and training classes, which in turn benefits the community and develops the City’s future work force.

The Youth Employment Program runs for eight weeks each summer; however the Consortium begins planning for the program in January of each year. Best practices and previous challenges are reviewed and adjustments are made to improve upon the prior year’s program. There is collaboration throughout the process with non-profit organizations, service providers and Cincinnati Public Schools, as well as various

City departments. As federal funding decreased for these types of programs, the Consortium utilized private sector connections to increase corporate donations and sponsorships, resulting in a 56% increase of private donations. The Consortium continues strategic efforts to increase funding, which would allow more youth participation in future programs.

Additional Participating City Departments:

- *Enterprise Technology Solutions*
- *Fire*
- *Human Resources*
- *Parks*
- *Police*
- *Recreation Commission*

Fire Department

The Cincinnati Fire Department (CFD) continuously seeks new methods and best practices to improve the level of services provided to the citizens of Cincinnati. In addition to providing fire suppression, emergency medical services, arson investigation and hazardous material/ device response, CFD educates the public about fire prevention and safety. *Appendix C* summarizes several citywide initiatives CFD has been involved in.

1. **Stop the Bleed Campaign** – CFD became involved in this project in 2017 and is on the forefront of this initiative nationally. Stop the Bleed is a national campaign to raise awareness of life saving strategies and provide public access to bleeding control tools. Its intention is to cultivate grassroots efforts to encourage bystanders to become trained and empowered to help in a bleeding emergency, prior to the arrival of emergency personnel. CFD is currently focusing its efforts on educating the teachers and employees within the Cincinnati Public School system and the Archdiocese of Cincinnati schools, as well as major employers in the region. To date, over fifty school nurses and all of the faculty/staff of a major high school have received the training.

Additional Participating City Departments:

- *Health*

2. **Fire Recruit Community Service Projects** – This is a program CFD has utilized in the past and hopes to reinstate in the future. Newly hired fire recruits were challenged to participate in two community service projects of their choosing, together as one unit. The types of projects chosen varied, and the results were both successful and highly beneficial for all. In addition to helping out those in need, the projects allowed CFD to interact with citizens during a positive event rather than just during tragic circumstances.

Health Department

The Cincinnati Health Department (CHD) is designated as a Federally Qualified Health Center and serves over 40,000 patients annually. In addition to administering medical and dental care at facilities throughout the city and inspecting all food service operations, CHD has several environmental programs designed to improve and protect quality of life in Cincinnati's neighborhoods, such as Health Promotion & Worksite Wellness, Mosquito and Bed Bug Control, and Litter/Weed complaints. CHD is actively involved in community initiatives, some of which are described in *Appendix D*.

Most recently, CHD became involved in developing a public health model to address the opioid epidemic in Cincinnati. Together with Police and Fire, CHD identified initiatives and resources needed to reduce the rate of heroin overdoses and the burden on first responders. In addition, they focused on expanding harm reduction initiatives such as availability of Naloxone, syringe exchange services and enhanced access to treatment processes.

Public Services

The Department of Public Services (DPS) is responsible for providing many “basic” services to the citizens of Cincinnati, including solid waste collection, neighborhood maintenance, street and traffic maintenance systems, a responsive customer service communication system, and fleet services. Consequently, DPS frequently participates in citywide problem-solving efforts, some of which are summarized in *Appendix E*.

A significant shift by the City and DPS in their approach to reduce chronic litter, dumping and blight has occurred over the past several years. Rather than utilizing traditional reactionary

responses to address these issues, DPS has created proactive, innovative initiatives to stay on top of the issues before they become major problems. This change in strategy involved a thorough review of current systems and utilized existing tools, data and the input of multiple City departments to assess the challenges and determine how to overcome them. This process in itself is an example of the City embracing the problem-solving philosophy. Two of the resulting programs are summarized below:

Greenspace Maintenance Plan – Prior to 2014, neighborhood and community leaders were increasingly frustrated with how litter, blight and illegal dumping were addressed in their neighborhood. The City’s approach to greenspace maintenance had been primarily reactive – most sites were cleaned up only as a result of Citizen Service Requests (complaints). This process was inefficient, customer service levels were inconsistent, and there was ambiguity regarding whose role and responsibility it was to address certain issues.

DPS, in cooperation with the Office of Performance & Data Analytics (OPDA), created and implemented several new programs which significantly improved DPS response times, customer service levels and neighborhood quality of life. The Greenspace Plan is a comprehensive neighborhood cleaning strategy to optimize and strategically deploy resources. This initiative provided clarity as to responsibilities, identified locations for maintenance and provided a clear direction and focus. Additional partnering agencies include the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT), the Cincinnati Area Geographic Information System (CAGIS) and Keep Cincinnati Beautiful.

Private Lot Abatement Program (PLAP) – Concurrent with the implementation of the Greenspace Maintenance Plan, the City launched the newly overhauled Private Lot Abatement Program (PLAP), which holds absent landlords accountable to maintain and beautify their properties. PLAP promotes thriving, safe and healthy neighborhoods through cleaning and abatement of private lots, while increasing code enforcement and civil citation revenue to reinvest back in PLAP.

When overgrown or blighted properties are reported, code enforcement inspectors respond to physically inspect these properties. Civil citations are issued to the owners

for appropriate violations. If the property is still in violation 10 days later, a second citation is issued, the property is considered “abandoned” and is included in PLAP for abatement and ongoing maintenance. Properties with multiple abatements may be candidates for sale or legal lot re-purposing through the Hamilton County Land Bank.

Some significant achievements have been realized as a result of these and other DPS initiatives:

- A 59% reduction in litter and weed complaints from 2016 to March 2017
- The number of blighted lots cleaned has risen from 250 in 2014 to 1,245 in 2016. As of March 2017, 914 lots had been cleaned.
- Eight digital “CincyInsight” dashboards, dealing specifically with blight, litter and quality of life issues, were developed to allow the general public and City staff to engage and track progress in real-time.
- Every city-owned greenspace is proactively cleaned and maintained on an ongoing, scheduled basis.
- Cameras installed in targeted areas resulted in 20 illegal dumping cases investigated for criminal prosecution.

Recreation Commission

The Cincinnati Recreation Commission (CRC) regularly partners with City departments as well as external organizations to address community and crime issues affecting Cincinnati neighborhoods. *Appendix F* highlights four premier programs, including the following:

1. **Queen City SWISH** – The SWISH program (Safety While Integrating Skills & Hoops) was developed for Cincinnati teens to participate in a basketball league centered around learning life skills and preventing drug abuse. In addition, students interact with first responders in a casual, fun, mentoring atmosphere, allowing them to gain a better understanding of each other. The program runs for approximately two months, and over 200 youth have participated in the leagues.

Additional Participating City Departments:

- *Fire*
- *Police*

2. **Teen Track & Field Program** – This 12-week program was designed to provide a drug-free environment and healthy lifestyles education for both boys and girls. The program is available during both Spring and Fall, and over 270 youth have participated in the past three years.

Transportation & Engineering

The Department of Transportation and Engineering (DOTe) strives to provide a safe and balanced transportation system to support economic vitality and neighborhood livability. DOTe is a frequent participant in citywide community improvement efforts, especially capital projects involving vehicle and pedestrian traffic safety (see *Appendix G*).

1. **Liberty Street Pedestrian Safety Improvement Project** – Liberty Street is a major corridor in the neighborhood of Over-the-Rhine, and has become increasingly dangerous for pedestrians due to neighborhood expansion and increased traffic volume. This project was recently implemented and is in the initial stages of design. A project team has been established and numerous meetings have been held with community members and stakeholders to discuss specific issues and possible solutions. Construction is scheduled to begin in early to mid-2018.
2. **Citywide Pedestrian Safety Improvement Project** – Over the past year, DOTe has met with approximately a dozen neighborhoods and the University of Cincinnati to discuss their pedestrian safety concerns. These discussions have included community councils, individual stakeholders, business owners and school administrators. The result has been identification of primary, target locations in need of improvements to increase the safety of streets and intersections for pedestrians and bicyclists. This effort has resulted in support from City Council by inclusion in the current 2018-2019 capital budget.

Police Department

Since the implementation of the Collaborative Agreement, the Cincinnati Police Department (CPD) has taken the lead in researching, embracing and utilizing problem-solving as the principle strategy to address crime and disorder issues. One innovative macro-project recently launched by CPD is the Place-Based Investigations of Violent Offender Territories (PIVOT).

PIVOT is a strategy developed to address small areas where violence has been chronic and sustained. This strategy focuses on identifying place networks that facilitate violence. The goal is to disrupt offenders' ability to harm individuals and the surrounding community, using a problem-oriented approach that capitalizes both on focused deterrence and place network interventions. Sustainable solutions are considered paramount.

PIVOT was developed in the fall of 2015 and launched in the spring of 2016. The current operational plan includes a centralized CPD PIVOT team that partners with representatives from many City departments, community groups, regional government and non-profit entities to implement responses. The PIVOT team focused on two project sites during 2016, which are summarized in *Appendix H*. Additional information about PIVOT analytics and partners can be found on the City of Cincinnati website:

<http://www.cincinnati-oh.gov/police/community-involvement/pivot/>

PIVOT is already recognized for its innovative strategies and successful outcomes. The program has been selected as one of the top three finalists for the 2017 Herman Goldstein Award for Excellence in Problem-Oriented Policing Submissions, which will be chosen in October 2017. The Goldstein Award recognizes innovative and effective problem-oriented policing (POP) projects that have achieved measurable success in resolving recurring specific crime, disorder or public safety problems faced by police and the community. Being selected as a finalist out of numerous submissions from world-wide governmental agencies is an extreme honor and accomplishment.

One of the most difficult challenges CPD and all City departments struggle with is consistent, accurate, useful documentation of our efforts. As evidenced in this report, there are many citywide problem-solving issues being addressed by a number of departments. However when it comes to documenting these efforts there is no uniform process or means to record each department's contribution to the project. In addition, actual workload demands often compete with documentation efforts.

CPD documents police-initiated projects via the Problem Solving Tracking System (PSTS), a database created in 2007 and updated several times since then in an effort to improve both its efficiency and value to the department. Each project in PSTS includes information about the additional community stakeholders, City departments and law enforcement agencies that

contributed to or assisted on the project. *Appendix I* contains the results of a recent audit of the PSTS database, highlighting the various entities that collaborated with CPD on 178 projects during the period of January 1, 2014 through July 31, 2017. A more in-depth assessment of the PSTS database and CPD Procedure 12.370, Problem Solving Project Process, will be included in the third evaluation report, “*Community Problem-Oriented Policing Strategy.*”

Other Agency Participation

The Police Department (CPD) has developed strong working relationships with many federal, state, regional and local law enforcement agencies. Multifaceted teams, involving numerous agencies, work together to target criminal activity as well as improve the quality of life for all citizens, not just those living in Cincinnati. This segment will focus primarily on the two CPD divisions who work extensively with outside agencies: Criminal Investigations Section and Special Investigations Section.

Criminal Investigations Section

The CPD Criminal Investigations Section (CIS) includes personnel assigned to Homicide, Financial Crimes, Personal Crimes and Fugitive Apprehension. These assignments afford a unique opportunity for CPD personnel to participate in problem-solving, as their investigations provide valuable insight about repeat problems faced by victims, witnesses and other affected persons or groups. Some of the more successful collaborative projects include:

1. **Hamilton County Child Fatality Review Team** – CPD Homicide Unit has been involved with the Hamilton County Child Fatality Review Team (CFRT) since its inception in 1996. The CFRT strives to prevent child deaths by examining the causes in the aggregate, making policy recommendations by reviewing child deaths in Hamilton County, and increasing coordination and communication between agencies and systems. The main goals of the CFRT are to compile uniform statistics on all deaths of children under the age of 18, accurately identify and document the causes of death and trends, identify preventable causes of death and

provide recommendations about policy changes in public health and safety, and develop uniform protocols and procedures for investigating child deaths.

The CFRT includes representatives from the following agencies: Hamilton County Public Health, Cincinnati Health Department, Hamilton County Jobs and Family Services, Children's Hospital, Hamilton County Coroner's Office, Hamilton County Prosecutor's Office, Hamilton County Juvenile Court, Hamilton County Mental Health Board, and UC Health, and the Cincinnati Police and Fire Departments.

In 2008, a long-term problem-solving project (PSTS# OTH-2008-000113) was initiated by Homicide Unit to address improper sleeping arrangements resulting in accidental deaths of children two years of age and under. Analysis of 91 child deaths during the years 2003-2008 identified seven "hot spots" across the city for specific response targeting. In addition to collaborating with CFRT representatives on a public educational campaign, Homicide Unit provided Infant Vitality Awareness training during the 2010 CPD In-Service training and developed a new form for officers to use to quickly document possible sleeping hazards observed during their normal course of duties. The completed form is then forwarded to the Neighborhood Liaison officers for follow-up.

This project encompassed the years 2009-2013 and was highly successful. The assessment shows a significant decrease in infant fatalities, from 91 during the 5-year analysis period to 62 between 2009 and 2013, a decrease of 32%.

- 2. VALU and CCROW** – The Victims Assistance Liaison Unit (VALU) is a program offered to the surviving families of homicide which occur in the City and are investigated by CIS. VALU is staffed with a full time Victim's Advocate, a licensed social worker with a Master's Degree who specializes in crisis intervention and mental health services. Homicide also partners with student interns from local universities to assist with the process. The Victim's Advocate and interns respond to the scene with homicide detectives and provide support and services to the families. Follow-up services include individual grief counseling, group therapy, assistance with funeral planning and/or other immediate needs of the family. VALU also provides emotional

support to the survivors of suicides, baby deaths, and accidental deaths. VALU is funded by a grant from the Ohio Attorney General's office to serve victims of crime.

Since 2014, VALU began calling all homicide victim families (from 2007 to present) to complete well checks and arrange meetings with the detectives assigned to their loved ones case. In 2016, CPD started a new program; "Cincinnati Citizens Respect Our Witnesses (CCROW)". The CCROW Program assists witnesses of violent crime and homicides to meet their immediate needs such as relocation or providing safety measures in the home. CCROW also offers weekly counseling and well check calls, as well as accompaniment to all court related proceedings. Community stakeholders from all over the city attended training to become volunteers of the program. Funding for CCROW was originally awarded by City Council; in October 2016 the CCROW program was included under VALU and is now funded by the same grant.

Special Investigations Section

The CPD Special Investigations Section (SIS) includes personnel assigned to Intelligence, Narcotics, Homeland Security and Organized Crime units. The primary function of these units is to support and assist law enforcement agencies, community stakeholders and public officials in the reduction of crime, disorder, and organized group activity. This mission is accomplished by obtaining and analyzing information to identify crime patterns, trends, and offenders; and the development of correlations to assist management in allocation, and deployment of resources in an attempt to thwart criminal activities and address public safety matters.

Some SIS personnel are assigned to specialized task forces to work in conjunction with other local, state or federal agents. Examples of these partnerships include:

1. **FBI Joint Terrorism Task Force (JTTF)** focuses on terrorism-related issues with local, regional, national, and international implications. Members create intelligence products on significant developments or trends related to terrorism. These intelligence products support intelligence-led policing efforts, implementing protective measures, or other target hardening initiatives. JTTF personnel provide significant planning, cross - agency coordination, threat assessment, and investigation for numerous large-scale, annual special events.

2. **Terrorism Early Warning Group (TEWG)** is a part of the Greater Cincinnati Fusion Center, which was formed as a regional cooperative effort among public safety and health agencies throughout the Greater Cincinnati area as a means to combat potential terrorist activity. It serves as a focal point within the state and local environment for the receipt, analysis, gathering, and sharing of threat-related information amongst federal, state, and local partners. TEWG produces actionable intelligence for dissemination, which can aid other law enforcement organizations in their investigative operations. Personnel conduct Intelligence Liaison Officer training for regional law enforcement personnel, quarterly information sessions to provide information on current terroristic tactics and practices, risk assessments for public and private large events, as well as threat assessments on critical infrastructures.

3. **Priority Offender/Violent Crime Working Group** is a multidisciplinary response to combating crime and violence in Cincinnati communities. This comprehensive enforcement approach includes federal (FBI, ATF, US Attorney), state (Ohio Attorney General, Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation) and local (Hamilton County Sheriff's Office, Ohio Parole Authority, and Hamilton County Probation) participant partners sharing intelligence and conducting coordinated operations.

Problem-Solving Education and Engagement

Introduction

Understanding and utilizing Community Problem-Oriented Policing (CPOP) is the central process necessary to accomplish the goals of the Collaborative Agreement. The operative provisions of the CA support this philosophy, and designated all of the Parties as having the responsibility to provide problem-solving education to community stakeholders. For purposes of this report, the City Manager requested submissions from the Parties highlighting some of the informational and educational outreach efforts made to improve understanding and support the problem-solving policing philosophy.

Citizen Complaint Authority

The Citizen Complaint Authority (CCA) continues to reach out to community stakeholders, citizens and CPD to increase awareness about civilian oversight. Recently, CCA developed a new CCA Brochure, complaint form, information sheet and contact cards based upon feedback received from the community. The complaint form is more dynamic and is presented in the form of a pamphlet, which is user-friendly and transportable. The information sheet was created to supplement CCA presentations with an overview of CCA. The contact cards are City business cards imprinted with “To file a complaint against a Cincinnati Police Officer, contact CCA” and CCA’s contact information. The brochure and information sheet is available to the public at: <http://www.cincinnati-oh.gov/ccia/>.

Many of CCA’s outreach efforts from 2016 and 2017 were listed in the initial CA Review report, “*Bias-free Policing and Officer Accountability*”. Some additional community engagement efforts include:

July – November 2015

- ▶ US Department of State’s International Visitor Leadership Program Presentation (Croatia, Ukraine, Republic of Kosovo, and Czech Republic)
- ▶ New CCA Board Member Orientation

- ▶ Over-the-Rhine Community Council
- ▶ CPD New Supervisor Training
- ▶ New CCA Board Member Orientation
- ▶ East Price Hill Community Council
- ▶ Human Impact Patterns Regarding Ohio Community Police Relations
- ▶ US Department of State’s International Visitor Leadership Program Presentation (Estonia and Ghana)
- ▶ US Department of State’s International Visitor Leadership Program Presentation (Chile, Costa Rica, Dominican Republic, Nicaragua, and Uruguay)

July – September 2017

- ▶ US Department of State’s International Visitor Leadership Program Presentation (Colombia)
- ▶ Hartwell Improvement Association
- ▶ New CCA Board Member Orientation
- ▶ Video Interviews with CPD Officers (Interviews to be presented during the community engagement exercises)
- ▶ Mt. Lookout Community Council
- ▶ Oakley Community Council
- ▶ Mt. Airy Town Council

Since the submission of the initial CA Review report, CCA and the Cincinnati Black United Front (CBUF) also developed and executed two additional surveys. The “Criminal Justice and Community Professionals” survey (*Appendix J*) was completed by 31 participants and is currently being analyzed by the University of Cincinnati (UC) Department of Political Science. The “CA and CPOP – Officers Survey” (*Appendix K*) was completed by 310 CPD employees and will be analyzed via Survey Monkey. The results of all surveys will be shared with the public in the near future via community forums, social media and the internet.

Office of Human Relations

In 2016, the Office of Human Relations (OHR) was formed under the City Manager's Office. OHR works with other City offices to set an intentional strategy for the future and enhance the level of work of the office and CIRV initiative.

Appendix L provides information about ongoing community engagement and training initiatives being undertaken by the Office of Human Relations.

Fraternal Order of Police

The Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) declined to participate in the CA Refresh project and did not submit a summary for this report.

Community Police Partnering Center

The Community Police Partnering Center (CPPC) did not submit a summary for this report.

Cincinnati Black United Front

The Cincinnati Black United Front (CBUF) did not submit a summary for this report.

American Civil Liberties Union of Ohio

The American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU) did not submit a summary for this report.

Oversight and Auditing

Another important goal of the CA was to “Improve Education, Oversight, Monitoring, Hiring Practices and Accountability of CPD”. When oversight by the Federal Monitor came to an end in 2008, the role was assumed by the City Manager’s Advisory Group (MAG). MAG is composed of members from Police, the FOP, and various community representatives, and is responsible for monitoring the Collaborative Agreement reporting process, public outreach, and for providing implementation recommendations. *Appendix M* contains the agendas from MAG meetings held in 2016 and 2017. The following overview was provided by Mr. Stan Ross, Collaborative Agreement Sustainability Manager:

“MAG reviews all documents, databases, and reports regarding Collaborative Agreement Compliance. MAG monitors RAND Reports, Citizens Complaint Authority Reports, and the Cincinnati Police Employee Tracking Solutions risk management system for an inclusive perspective on officer conduct and CPD efforts to improve police-community relations. Following review, MAG provides information dispersion via print, web, and public programming.

Conducting outreach activities and promoting dialogue between Police, stakeholders, and the public; MAG also provides a forum for police-community relation discussions. Police-Community engagement activities include civic meetings, special events, and crime prevention programming.

In addition to community outreach and compliance reporting, MAG recommends the necessary metrics to ensure full and timely implementation of the Collaborative Agreement.

Outlined goals within the Collaborative Agreement Plan include the development of proactive police-community problem solving, the development of cooperative police-community relationships, improvements to police recruitment and education, ensured fair, equitable, and courteous treatment for all; and, efforts for a public understanding

of police policies and procedures with recognition of exceptional efforts by officers to foster community trust. To ensure progress and implementation, MAG tracks quarterly crime summaries, reviews traffic and pedestrian stops, evaluates Police use of force, assesses reports by the Citizen Complaint Authority, and facilitates stakeholder meetings to address problem solving approaches.

To ensure Agreement sustainability, MAG continuously measures police-community relations by holding the affiliated parties accountable for their responsibilities. Cincinnati Police are responsible for advancing and institutionalizing cooperative problem-solving techniques throughout the department. The Citizen's Complaint Authority is responsible for investigating serious interventions by Police; and, community representatives are responsible for vocalizing their concerns. In total, MAG works across these arenas to safeguard reforms and weigh improvement efforts of police-community relations.

MAG meets quarterly and advises the Citizen's Complaint Authority, the Cincinnati Police Partnership Center, and the Office of Human Relations to continuously conduct neighborhood opinion surveys and to host community forums. To foster continued community dialogue and engagement MAG supports programs, special events, and the dispersion of educational materials linked to improving Community Police relations. MAG also supports an enhancement to public relations campaigns; including but not limited to Citi-Cable, Social Media, and printed collaterals".

Evaluation Protocol

Introduction

In order for the CA to serve as a mutual accountability plan, the Parties were tasked with developing system(s) of evaluation to track the attainment of the agreed upon goals, and develop a protocol to accomplish the system of evaluation. This Evaluation Protocol included the use of periodic surveys; periodic observations of problem-solving projects; community meetings and citizen complaint processes; and annual statistical compilations of interactions between the police and community members.

Over the years there has been a decline by the Parties in utilizing some of these systems. As previously mentioned in the *Bias-free Policing and Officer Accountability* evaluation, CPD was unable to maintain the level of statistical compilations that RAND had provided during the CA, and is evaluating several replacement options. CCA and CPD continue to work together to evaluate and improve the citizen complaint process as necessary. Macro-level problem solving projects are regularly discussed at the MAG meetings and have also garnered widespread attention through POP award nominations and public documentaries: [PivotPoint Documentary link](#). While the City currently lacks a structured system to document and evaluate each department's problem solving efforts, the work continues to be enthusiastically implemented and neighborhood quality of life issues are improving.

Office of Performance & Data Analytics

In October 2014, the Office of Performance and Data Analytics (OPDA) was created to establish a comprehensive, integrated performance management program for the City to improve efficiency and transparency, and have a cumulative impact of delivering better, faster, and smarter services. OPDA has collaborated extensively with CPD and continues to assist in facilitating accountability between City administration, community stakeholders and the general public. A prime example of this is the analytical support OPDA provides in the quarterly MAG meetings. *Appendix N* outlines both the current and future scope of work provided by OPDA, including the creation of a specific “dashboard” to be utilized by MAG.

CPD Staffing Processes

The Evaluation Protocol also included a review of the hiring, promotion and transfer processes within the CPD (CA ¶ 43). The promotional process for all City personnel, including police, is regulated by the City of Cincinnati and Board of Education Civil Service Commission (CRC). Civil Service Rule 10: Promotions, is included as reference in *Appendix O*.

Recruiting and Hiring

The hiring process for CPD begins with the Recruitment & Background Squad (RBS), which is supervised by CPD Personnel Management. An important consideration in staffing RBS is to ensure the investigator makeup is diverse. Currently, RBS is staffed with four males and three females: three are African American, three are Caucasian, and one is Hispanic. The RBS also focuses heavily on recruiting a diverse pool of applicants to be considered for hiring. Recruiting efforts include: press releases, fitness challenges, boot camps, community forums, college forums, direct mail initiatives, various TV, radio and print advertising, and online social media venues. CPD is always looking for additional ways and new trends to communicate with candidates.

The recruiting and hiring process is extensive and can take up to two years, depending upon City budget approval. This process includes:

- Application period of 3-4 months, which allows Recruiting and Background to actively recruit.
- Written exam – this process is under the jurisdiction of City Human Resources (HR). Currently City HR utilizes a 3rd party, IOSolutions, to administer the Police Recruit written exam.
- Physical Ability Test (PAT) – All candidates who pass the written exam are asked to take the PAT. City HR and CPD Training Academy partner to administer this testing.
- Completion of a Personal History Questionnaire (PHQ) is required to assist the Background Investigator and Polygraphist in making assessments during the process.
- An eligibility list is created by City HR and must be approved by CSC prior to the names being provided to the Recruiting and Background Squad for processing.
- Names referred from the list include the top scoring 25%, plus the number of vacancies, minus one. Additional names are referred as candidates withdraw or are removed for criteria violations. A newly revised 2017 Disqualifying Criteria report, approved by CSC,

is included as *Appendix P*. Anyone removed from the process for a criteria violation has the right to appeal through the Civil Service Commission.

- Initial background checks include review of the PHQ, reference checks, previous military and/or employment, criminal background checks, and polygraphs.
- Starting in 2017, CPD has partnered with the Personnel Research and Development Company to perform The Quick View Law Enforcement Assessment in the initial background phase. This behavioral assessment reflects how people are likely to behave in a variety of areas. This assessment will not disqualify anyone but will be used in the overall review of who is best fit for the role of Police Officer.
- Home interviews are conducted on applicants still in the process at this time.
- The R & B squad presents profiles of candidates deemed to be the best fit to the Police Chief, who makes the final selection of the class and alternates.
- Offer letters are made pending several more steps, including a pre-entrance Physical Fitness Assessment (PFA), a psychological assessment, medical examination and drug screen.
- When an applicant successfully passes all screenings, CSC approves their appointment.

In 2014 CPD staffing reached a critical low, a result of a six year “hiring freeze.” In order to fill some vacancies quickly, CPD utilized a Lateral Entry Police Officer (LEO) process to recruit qualified officers from other law enforcement agencies. To qualify for LEO consideration, an applicant must be a current, full time Law Enforcement Officer, already possess the Ohio Peace Officer Training Commission (OPOTC) Peace Officer certification, and have a minimum of two years’ experience. The process involves a shorter application period and less training, as the applicant is hired as a Police Officer via an oral exam. The LEO process was used to fill the 103rd class in November 2014 and the 105th class in March 2015. One downside to using this process is that the number of qualified applicants is much lower for this process and diversity is more difficult to achieve.

Between 2014 and 2017, CPD has hired and trained five classes, with a sixth to start on November 5, 2017. Prior to that, the last class was hired on 6/22/2008. Of the five recent classes, two were hired through the Lateral Entry Police Officer (LEO) process and three classes were hired through the Police Recruit process. The 108th class starting in November was hired through the Police Recruit process. The table below provides information about these classes:

Class Number	Class Type	Hire Date	Number Hired	Number Graduated	Graduation Date
103 rd	LEO	5/11/14	19	19	7/3/14
104 th	Recruit	8/31/14	59	56	2/27/15
105 th	LEO	3/15/15	23	22	5/22/15
106 th	Recruit	1/3/16	54	50	7/1/16
107 th	Recruit	12/4/16	24	23	6/16/17
108 th	Recruit	11/6/17	35		5/18/18
109 th	Recruit	2018	Testing in Process		

CPD Personnel Assignments and Transfers

The primary goal of any law enforcement agency regarding staffing and workforce levels is to provide adequate services to the public. Decisions regarding the allocation of resources and the assignment/ transfer of personnel are dependent upon a number of factors, including but not limited to: experience, knowledge, skill, work ethic and productivity. Management must weigh the importance of selecting an employee who possesses the preferred traits with providing an opportunity to a less experienced employee, while keeping the department's best interest at heart.

To help guide these decisions, CPD administration utilizes processes outlined in Procedure 13.110: Assignment, Rotation and Transfer of Personnel (*Appendix Q*), Procedure 13.112: Assignment Availability Section Process (*Appendix R*), and the FOP/City Labor Agreement. Mandatory transfers are implemented for probationary officers to broaden their patrol knowledge and experience. Transfers may also occur if an administrative evaluation indicates an employee would benefit from a change of assignment. When there is an opening for an officer or sergeant in a specialized assignment, it is published in the Department Staff Notes and personnel interested in applying for the position submit a Form 77, Sworn Assignment Application (*Appendix S*). This begins the selection process, which includes review of the employee's personnel record and disciplinary history, interviews and supervisory recommendations. The Police Chief considers all of the information provided to him and makes the final selection. All assignments for the rank of lieutenant and above are not subject to this process and instead are selected at the discretion of the Police Chief.