

Date: July 29, 2014
To: Scott C. Stiles, Interim City Manager
From: Lauren Sundararajan, CFE, Internal Audit Manager *LS*
Copies to: William E. Moller, Assistant City Manager
Gerald Checco, Interim Director of Public Services
Pam King, Acting Director of Citizen Complaint and Internal Audit
Subject: **Department of Public Services – Customer Service Center Audit**

Attached is the Department of Public Services – Customer Service Center (Call Center) audit report. This performance audit examined and evaluated the Call Center to ensure citizens and departments were provided with quality customer service, Call Center operations were effective and efficient, and performance goals and objectives were met. We have completed the audit in accordance with Internal Audit's fiscal year 2013/2014 Audit Work Plan.

We would like to thank the management and staff of the Department of Public Services for their assistance and cooperation during this audit.

If you need any further information please contact me.

Attachment

Public Services Customer Service Center Audit

July, 2014



Lauren Sundararajan, CFE
Internal Audit Manager

Tamar Mason, CPA
Internal Auditor

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
I. Introduction	2
Background	
Audit Selection	
Audit Objectives	
Audit Scope and Methodology	
Scope Limitations	
Statement of Auditing Standards	
Commendations	
II. Audit Findings and Recommendations	4
III. Conclusion	11
IV. Department of Public Services Response	12

Executive Summary

Internal Audit (IA) performed an audit of the Department of Public Services Customer Service Center (Call Center). The audit objectives were to ensure citizens and departments were provided with quality customer service, Call Center operations were effective and efficient, and performance goals and objectives were met.

The Call Center has a very important role; they represent the City's frontline of communication by having daily contact with citizens. Due to the nature of their responsibility to assist and inform the public, it is imperative that they provide quality customer service.

IA found that the Call Center's ability to operate effectively and efficiently is limited. Some of the tools needed to provide quality customer service were missing. For example, policies and procedures necessary to maintain proper internal controls were not in place. In addition, an adequate training program does not exist for new hires, as well as on-going training to assist staff in properly handling calls.

Performance measures are used to indicate operation effectiveness. Best practices indicate service level is one of several commonly used performance measures in the industry. IA found that Public Services have not clearly defined the expected level of service and other relevant performance measures. Without having performance measures in place, management is unable to accurately gauge whether or not the Call Center is meeting the department's objectives.

Management review and oversight is also necessary to ensure the department objectives are carried out appropriately. IA found discrepancies in some of the Call Center reports. IA was informed that the reports were not reviewed by management. Additionally, quality assurance monitoring was not performed.

Proper inter-departmental communication makes satisfying citizens' service requests easier. Communication between coordinating departments needs to be improved. IA found that the Call Center did not document complaints received from other City departments to ensure issues had been resolved and communicated to the department. IA also found inconsistencies regarding the service request closeout process. Call Center management was unable to provide any documentation indicating which party is responsible for closing out service requests in the Customer Service Response System (CSR). Additionally, the Call Center did not follow-up with departments on service requests that had been open for extended periods of time.

Overall, IA found that several opportunities for improving Call Center operations exist. IA recommends establishing comprehensive policies and procedures, providing training, defining performance measures and goals, providing additional management oversight, and strengthening inter-departmental communication. By addressing these areas, the Call Center would realize a more efficient and effective operation, while providing quality customer service to citizens and City departments.

I. Introduction

Background

The Call Center offers the public a convenient avenue for addressing questions, complaints, service requests and other City related inquiries. Individuals may contact the Call Center by calling 591-6000 during normal business hours of 7 a.m. to 5 p.m., Monday through Friday. Online access is available by logging onto www.5916000.com or via mobile application. Individuals may request a variety of services such as, pothole repairs, trash removal, graffiti cleanup, and traffic issues, among others. In 2013, citizens made approximately 150,000 calls to the Call Center.

The primary focus of the Call Center is to facilitate and resolve citizen concerns as well as community requests. In doing so, Call Center staff coordinates efforts with other City departments to resolve these issues. Two computer systems are utilized in the Call Center to carry out day to day operations. These two systems serve entirely different functions and do not interact with each other. The Avaya Telephone Management System (Avaya) tracks real-time Call Center stats and provides various performance reports. The Customer Service Response System (CSR) is a user interface and service request system designed to provide an organization-wide view of service requests received and their status. Individuals may request over 100 different types of services. The service request is entered into CSR and automatically routed to the appropriate department, agency, or inspector. Citizens are offered a tracking number to check the status of their requests. Additionally, the CSR system can generate various data reports for management review.

Within the past five years the Call Center has experienced a reduction in staff due to budget constraints. In 2013, Call Center staff consisted of a manager and approximately seven full time call takers. To continue to meet public demand, efforts have been made to encourage online submissions of service requests; however, according to Public Services, the majority of requests in 2013 were received via telephone.

Audit Selection

The audit was conducted in accordance with the FY 2013/2014 Internal Audit work plan.

Audit Objectives

The primary objectives of this audit were to ensure citizens and City departments were provided with quality customer service, Call Center operations were effective and efficient, and performance goals and objectives were met.

Audit Scope and Methodology

This audit encompassed pertinent city staff, customer data, and IT systems related to the Call Center. Records reviewed included data generated during 2013.

To accomplish the objectives of this audit, IA used the following methodologies: interviewed city staff, examined systems, reviewed policies and procedures, and researched benchmarks of other cities.

Scope Limitations

Within the City there are multiple customer service centers in various departments. The primary focus of this audit was the Public Services Customer Service Center.

Statement of Auditing Standards

As required by Article II, Section 15 of the City of Cincinnati Administrative Code, this audit was conducted in accordance with the Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards (GAGAS), except for standard 3.96 pertaining to external peer review requirements. This exception did not have a material effect on the audit. Audit fieldwork was performed between April and June of 2014.

Commendations

Internal Audit commends the staff of the Department of Public Services on their cooperation throughout the audit.

II. Audit Findings and Recommendations

Policies and procedures were not in place.

Policies and procedures are necessary to maintain proper internal controls and to ensure effective and efficient operations. The policy and procedure manual should include all relevant procedures pertaining to systems used and instructions on proper execution of day to day activities. IA was informed that a policy and procedure manual has not been in place for several years. At a minimum, the policy and procedure manual should contain a comprehensive policy related to the CSR system, such as entering and closing out service requests, time frames for responding to service requests/completion time, and updating service request contacts. The policy should also include instructions on utilizing the telephone management system, reporting Call Center stats, training and monitoring staff, data retention, and performance goals and objectives. Without implementation and enforcement of policies and procedures the department will not achieve its objectives.

IA found that some service requests were retrieved from social media sites (Facebook, Twitter) and entered online into the CSR system or called in by city staff. In efforts to provide quality customer service, staff responded to service requests during non business hours. The volume of service requests received from Facebook or Twitter was not identified in CSR, and policies and procedures for managing these requests had not been implemented. Without determining a strategy and implementing a policy for managing service requests retrieved via social media, management may be unprepared to handle an increase in volume.

Recommendation 1: The Call Center should create a comprehensive policy and procedure manual that includes all relevant guidelines and procedures for the Call Center, and communicate the policy to staff and coordinating departments.

Department Response: Agree. A manual for Call Center policies and procedures is currently being developed to include specific call center procedures. This documentation will be updated annually and distributed. A Copy of the manual will be stored in the call center for any future auditing inquires. A Draft of the policies and procedures will be given to Director by September 30, 2014 with finalization target by November 30, 2014.

Recommendation 2: The Call Center should determine a strategy for handling service requests retrieved from social media, and ensure it is included in the policy and procedure manual.

Department Response: Agree. A request to have the addition of the “social media” type to be added to the CSR system has been made, allowing the organization to track any trends. This addition will be forwarded to the appropriate personnel including the City’s Information office. This recommendation will be completed prior to the release of this report. Completed and in place 07.21.2014.

Staff has not received adequate training.

Public Services Customer Service Center represents the City’s frontline of communication; therefore, it is imperative that staff receive proper training. Call Center staff are tasked with knowing and understanding department processes, policies, information systems, and day to day operations. In order to effectively carry out their job duties, staff must be properly trained.

IA found that a comprehensive training program was not in place. In addition, useful tools such as scripts or procedure manuals were not provided to help staff facilitate calls. Further, on-going training is not currently provided, and according to Call Center staff, training last occurred in 2009.

IA inquired with the Call Centers in the City of Lexington and the City of Columbus and found that an extensive training program is provided to new hires and on-going training occurs on a routine basis.

It is also imperative that Call Center staff enter accurate information into CSR so that the departments can handle the service requests efficiently. Staff failure to properly screen and route calls has resulted in redundant work and other issues for coordinating departments. One department mentioned they are concerned about the volume of mishandled calls received from the Call Center, and have begun to keep track of issues internally. IA inquired with another City department regarding training initiatives for the Call Center and found that the department offered to meet with Call Center staff to discuss proper call screening; however, the offer was not accepted. Implementing a comprehensive training program would improve the Call Center efficiency, and on-going training would help to reinforce current policies, introduce new policies, and clarify important issues.

Recommendation 3: The Call Center should implement a comprehensive training program for all Call Center employees. On-going training should be provided on a routine basis.

Department Response: Agree. An updated training manual for all classifications within the call center is currently underway. Several hands on training initiatives such as Radio Procedures, Software training (Microsoft Office), and Call management will be completed within the next 60 days. We are currently reviewing other options that will work with scheduling staff members (possible on line or a knowledge base) training can be used with minimal impact to operations. Comprehensive training content and schedule will be done by October 30, 2014.

Recommendation 4: The Call Center should create scripts and training manuals to assist staff with call resolution.

Department Response: Agree. Several scripts have already been generated. (Standard opening and closing scripts including offering of SR number as to assist in any follow up calls). A comprehensive review of all aspects of city services will be compiled, distributed and reviewed annually to provide a consistent and professional customer experience. Call Center manager and call center staff will have a draft completed for review by August 30, 2014.

Recommendation 5: The Call Center should meet with departments on a regular basis to address any concerns and to determine areas needing prompt attention.

Department Response: Agree. After the downsizing of the call center staff, many service requests that were non-related to Public Services were shifted back to those individual departments. In doing so the P/S call center concentrated solely on Public Services issues. There were no high level procedures provided to Public Services as to who would oversee contact lists or liaisons for any city department. Public Services updated names, phone numbers, and locations on an as needed basis. Public Service's is prepared to take lead in CSR customer service management as directed by administration. Public Services would need to establish a plan and procedure in order to be able to communicate effectively. Public Services proposes that all city departments submit updated contact list and a CSR liaison for

each respective department as to create an updated master list that would be distributed internally Annually. A memo from DPS to City Directors will be issued by August 1, 2014.

Performance measurements and goals were not clearly defined.

Performance measurements and goals are used to gauge an operation's effectiveness and efficiency. Operating a successful Call Center necessitates clearly defined performance measures and goals. Key performance indicators can also highlight areas needing improvement. Best practice indicates that some of the most common performance metrics used by Call Centers include, service level (the percentage of calls answered within a specific time frame), average speed of answer, average wait time, average handling time, abandoned call rate, average call answered per call taker, call volume, and cost per call. The Avaya Telephone Management System automatically tracks several of these performance metrics and reports performance results; however, IA found that Public Services has not clearly defined the Call Center performance goals. As a result, Call Center management is unable to compare performance goals with actual results.

Staff awareness of their performance is an important piece of the overall performance measurement process. A statistical report can be generated by the system that summarizes the call takers performance for the month. IA was informed that call takers have not received these reports in several years. Providing call takers with performance reports should increase compliance with performance goals, once defined.

Best practice indicates Call Centers should conduct customer satisfaction surveys to understand the perception of the caller experience with the Call Center. Increasing feedback from callers would help management to identify areas needing improvement, and also highlight positive experiences. Some Call Centers conduct post-call surveys or utilize surveying agencies.

Additionally, employee surveys can be used to gain valuable insight on staff morale. If employees are dissatisfied with some recent change or process it is important to find that out as quickly as possible, since such dissatisfaction may affect how the call taker performs on the phone. Encouraging feedback from staff or conducting anonymous staff surveys could assist management with achieving staff performance goals. IA found that Call Center management does not conduct customer satisfaction surveys or employee surveys.

Recommendation 6: Call Center management should define, document, and communicate performance measures and goals for Call Center operations and staff.

Department Response: Agree. A realistic target will be established for each staff member dependent on job classification. Monthly reviews will be forwarded to administration and filed for documentation purposes to assure quality control assurances starting with July 2014 as a baseline. Task to be done by Call Center Manager after close of month effective 08.01.2014.

Recommendation 7: The Call Center should provide call takers with performance reports on a regular basis to encourage compliance with performance measures and identify areas needing improvement.

Department Response: Agree. A more comprehensive performance measure will be used. Currently a single month statistical report is being used for the entire staff. Future performance

measure will include individual statistics along with measurable goals to be shared individually with each staff member after the close of the preceding month. This will go into effect 08.01.2104 due to the call management changeover.

Recommendation 8: The Call Center should encourage feedback from callers and employees by conducting satisfaction surveys.

Department Response: Agree with concern. Public Services encourages feedback as to be used as constructive tool to improve customer service. Concern: Staff levels are limited as to allow personnel to conduct surveys. A possible solution might be include a scripted line to direct callers to a city website to complete an online survey regarding their recent customer service experience. As part of the new ASPECT CMS systems an option for a post call survey will be available after each call. An optional manual survey has been developed and will be reviewed by Public Service Staff for a call back survey in which 10 surveys would be conducted monthly as an option to the on-line survey. Both options would be available as of 08.01.2014.

Additional management review and oversight is needed.

Management review and oversight is necessary to ensure department objectives are carried out appropriately. IA found that calls are recorded, but not monitored for quality assurance. IA randomly sampled 25 recorded calls from 2013 to determine if citizens were provided with quality customer service. Calls were evaluated based on the call takers problem solving ability, active listening skills, efficiency, professionalism, display of empathy for callers' issues, courtesy and other areas. IA found 10 (40%) of the 25 calls sampled did not provide quality customer service. Call monitoring allows management to determine the extent to which the call takers are able to satisfy the caller's needs, as well as evaluate the quality of service provided. Without having a quality monitoring process in place, areas needing improvement will not be detected in a timely manner.

Management review and oversight is also needed to ensure accurate reporting of Call Center data. IA reviewed the statistical reports of the calls received, the calls abandoned and other statistics, and found discrepancies and a calculation error. Upon further inquiry, IA was informed that the reports were not reviewed or analyzed by management. Additional management review and oversight could have detected these discrepancies.

Proper oversight and monitoring of key performance measures and goals are necessary to ensure the department objectives are met. Once management defines the performance measures and goals, routine monitoring should occur.

Recommendation 9: Call Center management should conduct quality assurance testing on a routine basis to ensure call takers are providing quality customer service to citizens.

Department Response: Agree. Although not documented, recorded calls are audited by the call center manager on a monthly basis. New procedures are in place as to have weekly auditing in place. In addition to the management auditing calls, The new CMS ASPECT has the ability to give each call center employee the ability to audit their own calls, which will be required monthly and will be used a training tool. Future auditing sessions will be documented to assist for any future auditing inquiries. This will be in place 07.31.2014.

Recommendation 10: Call Center management should review the Call Center statistical reports to detect discrepancies and ensure accuracy.

Department Response: Agree. The use of AVAYA call management system was used to generate reports with approx. 135 types including both real time and historical. Many of these reports were merged into spreadsheets where data may have become compromised. With the implementation of the Aspect system, most system reports can be custom made to the user's needs. Data will be reviewed monthly to assure quality assurance and will be in place 07.31.2014.

Recommendation 11: The Department of Public Services should routinely monitor whether performance measures and goals are being achieved.

Department Response: Agree with Concern. Performance measures will be benchmarked and documented at current staffing levels. Industry standards dictate what is the optimal target for a call center such as ACD times, wait times and hold times. With a reduced staff, Public Services will submit current service levels for review and direction of achievable acceptable levels. Technology including web service has assisted within customer service call center but with a reduced staff the call center will fall short of industry standards. Data will be submitted after close of month of July 2014 to determine what is the value of customer service to the City of Cincinnati. Data will be reviewed quarterly to assess service levels.

Inter-departmental communication needs improvement.

CSR was developed to provide an organization-wide view of service requests and responses to those requests. Utilization of CSR was also intended to improve inter-departmental communication and assist with meeting community expectations and service needs. IA found better communication is needed among coordinating departments. IA was informed that each department is responsible for closing out completed service requests in CSR; however, documentation to support this requirement was not provided. In addition, IA found inconsistencies regarding the CSR service request closeout process. For example, one department automatically closed out completed service requests in CSR, while another department retrieved the requests from CSR, but used a different system for close out. Also Call Center staff informed IA that some departments close out requests in CSR prior to completing the work.

Furthermore, Call Center staff does not follow-up on the requests that have been open for extended periods of time. As a result of these inconsistencies, IA was unable to determine the accuracy of completed service requests in CSR.

IA found the Call Center did not document complaints received from other departments. To provide quality customer service to City departments, complaints should be documented to ensure issues are resolved, and the resolution should be properly communicated to the department. Failing to document complaints and the resolution could lead to unresolved issues which could delay service request completion time.

IA also reviewed the CSR key contact list and found two former employees were listed. Key contacts are automatically linked to the particular service requested to expedite service requests in CSR. IA was informed that when employees leave or transfer to other departments that

information is not always communicated and updated in CSR. Failing to update key contacts in CSR will delay service completion time.

An efficient operation requires proper communication when coordinating efforts with other departments.

Recommendation 12: The Call Center should properly communicate CSR close-out processes to the coordinating departments.

Department Response: Somewhat Agree. The CSR system is a citywide system and tool for each department to use. CSR was designed for departments to open daily, perform tasks, track service requests and types along with reporting. As a real time system, departments then close out requests as to work performed or timelines in which it took to complete (Transfer to other departments, parts ordered, etc.). Reports are generated to show service levels for each type, neighborhood, division or department. These reports are viewed on a department or City administrative level. Public Services can assist in teaching how to close out service requests, but should be enforced by City administration by way of service levels by report.

Recommendation 13: The Call Center should periodically review service requests remaining open for extended periods of time and communicate with the coordinating department to determine the cause and correct the issue. Additionally, the reason for the delay should be documented, and delays should be routinely reported to management.

Department Response: Agree. Call center management can monitor such requests and forward requests that fall beyond acceptable thresholds. Again each department / division should monitor requests on a daily basis so that thresholds are not hit without a reason. Public Services will develop thresholds for service types as to assure prompt attention. Each Department and or Division can run reports weekly or even daily to see what is outstanding and able to police themselves and report in real time what is or is not closed out. Customer service can run a period report as a backup to make sure nothing was missed. The Director of Public Services will have access to the CSR systems and all levels of reporting to add to the oversight process. This will be completed by 08.01.2014.

Recommendation 14: The Call Center should record complaints received from coordinating departments and ensure issues are resolved. The resolution should be properly communicated to the coordinating department.

Department Response: Agree with concern. Complaints that are transferred to other departments become the ownership of the accepting departments. CSR requests include a comment and timeline as to document what has transpired within the requests itself. Without constant supervision of all service requests, the only way would be to manually transfer the request and email city personnel and include documentation within the comment section of the request. Internal CSR complaints are regularly communicated with CAGIS as we currently update service requests. Completed 07.25.2014 - A complaint resolution file has been created.

Recommendation 15: The Call Center should implement a process to obtain updated CSR contacts from all coordinating departments, and update the CSR system.

Department Response: Agree. Public Services has already begun the process of updating CSR contacts for each city department. An annual communication will be issued at the request

of the DPS Director to be updated and distributed to CSR users. The list can be compiled by Call Center staff and will be reviewed and completed by December 1, 2014.

Avaya's data storage capacity was limited.

Maintaining relevant historical Call Center data is necessary to have an effective and efficient Call Center operation. Historical data is needed for future inquiries and for performing trend analyses. IA was informed that Avaya only maintains data for approximately 16-18 months; however, according to Call Center management installation of a new telephone management system will be occurring in the near future.

Recommendation 16: The Call Center should ensure that the telephone management system has adequate data storage.

Department Response: Agree. The new call management system ASPECT being managed by CWW with an increased data capacity and historical range. Monthly and Annual reports will be documented and stored to assist both historical and future forecasting needs. The Cincinnati Water Works (CWW) will store data a total of 5 years with voice recordings for up to 3 years. This was considered acceptable by CWW . A final report will be run prior to the Avaya system server being shut down. This will be in place as 07.30.2014.

III. Conclusion

Providing quality customer service is paramount. To ensure the Call Center's objectives are met the appropriate tools must be in place. The audit revealed several opportunities for the Call Center to increase efficiency and provide quality customer service to citizen's as well as City departments. IA recommends establishing comprehensive policies and procedures, providing training, defining performance measures and goals, providing additional management oversight, and strengthening inter-departmental communication. Implementing these tools would promote an efficient and effective Call Center operation.

IV. Department of Public Services Response

Recommendation 1: The Call Center should create a comprehensive policy and procedure manual that includes all relevant guidelines and procedures for the Call Center, and communicate the policy to staff and coordinating departments.

Department Response: Agree. A manual for Call Center policies and procedures is currently being developed to include specific call center procedures. This documentation will be updated annually and distributed. A Copy of the manual will be stored in the call center for any future auditing inquires. A Draft of the policies and procedures will be given to Director by September 30, 2014 with finalization target by November 30, 2014.

Recommendation 2: The Call Center should determine a strategy for handling service requests retrieved from social media, and ensure it is included in the policy and procedure manual.

Department Response: Agree. A request to have the addition of the “social media” type to be added to the CSR system has been made, allowing the organization to track any trends. This addition will be forwarded to the appropriate personnel including the City’s Information office. This recommendation will be completed prior to the release of this report. Completed and in place 07.21.2014.

Recommendation 3: The Call Center should implement a comprehensive training program for all Call Center employees. On-going training should be provided on a routine basis.

Department Response: Agree. An updated training manual for all classifications within the call center is currently underway. Several hands on training initiatives such as Radio Procedures, Software training (Microsoft Office), and Call management will be completed within the next 60 days. We are currently reviewing other options that will work with scheduling staff members (possible on line or a knowledge base) training can be used with minimal impact to operations. Comprehensive training content and schedule will be done by October 30, 2014.

Recommendation 4: The Call Center should create scripts and training manuals to assist staff with call resolution.

Department Response: Agree. Several scripts have already been generated. (Standard opening and closing scripts including offering of SR number as to assist in any follow up calls). A comprehensive review of all aspects of city services will be compiled, distributed and reviewed annually to provide a consistent and professional customer experience. Call Center manager and call center staff will have a draft completed for review by August 30, 2014.

Recommendation 5: The Call Center should meet with departments on a regular basis to address any concerns and to determine areas needing prompt attention.

Department Response: Agree. After the downsizing of the call center staff, many service requests that were non-related to Public Services were shifted back to those individual departments. In doing so the P/S call center concentrated solely on Public Services issues.

There were no high level procedures provided to Public Services as to who would oversee contact lists or liaisons for any city department. Public Services updated names, phone numbers, and locations on an as needed basis. Public Service's is prepared to take lead in CSR customer service management as directed by administration. Public Services would need to establish a plan and procedure in order to be able to communicate effectively. Public Services proposes that all city departments submit updated contact list and a CSR liaison for each respective department as to create an updated master list that would be distributed internally Annually. A memo from DPS to City Directors will be issued by August 1, 2014.

Recommendation 6: Call Center management should define, document, and communicate performance measures and goals for Call Center operations and staff.

Department Response: Agree. A realistic target will be established for each staff member dependent on job classification. Monthly reviews will be forwarded to administration and filed for documentation purposes to assure quality control assurances starting with July 2014 as a baseline. Task to be done by Call Center Manager after close of month effective 08.01.2014.

Recommendation 7: The Call Center should provide call takers with performance reports on a regular basis to encourage compliance with performance measures and identify areas needing improvement.

Department Response: Agree. A more comprehensive performance measure will be used. Currently a single month statistical report is being used for the entire staff. Future performance measure will include individual statistics along with measurable goals to be shared individually with each staff member after the close of the preceding month. This will go into effect 08.01.2104 due to the call management changeover.

Recommendation 8: The Call Center should encourage feedback from callers and employees by conducting satisfaction surveys.

Department Response: Agree with concern. Public Services encourages feedback as to be used as constructive tool to improve customer service. Concern: Staff levels are limited as to allow personnel to conduct surveys. A possible solution might be include a scripted line to direct callers to a city website to complete an online survey regarding their recent customer service experience. As part of the new ASPECT CMS systems an option for a post call survey will be available after each call. An optional manual survey has been developed and will be reviewed by Public Service Staff for a call back survey in which 10 surveys would be conducted monthly as an option to the on-line survey. Both options would be available as of 08.01.2014.

Recommendation 9: Call Center management should conduct quality assurance testing on a routine basis to ensure call takers are providing quality customer service to citizens.

Department Response: Agree. Although not documented, recorded calls are audited by the call center manager on a monthly basis. New procedures are in place as to have weekly auditing in place. In addition to the management auditing calls, The new CMS ASPECT has the ability to give each call center employee the ability to audit their own calls, which will be

required monthly and will be used a training tool. Future auditing sessions will be documented to assist for any future auditing inquiries. This will be in place 07.31.2014.

Recommendation 10: Call Center management should review the Call Center statistical reports to detect discrepancies and ensure accuracy.

Department Response: Agree. The use of AVAYA call management system was used to generate reports with approx. 135 types including both real time and historical. Many of these reports were merged into spreadsheets where data may have become compromised. With the implementation of the Aspect system, most system reports can be custom made to the user's needs. Data will be reviewed monthly to assure quality assurance and will be in place 07.31.2014.

Recommendation 11: The Department of Public Services should routinely monitor whether performance measures and goals are being achieved.

Department Response: Agree with Concern. Performance measures will be benchmarked and documented at current staffing levels. Industry standards dictate what is the optimal target for a call center such as ACD times, wait times and hold times. With a reduced staff, Public Services will submit current service levels for review and direction of achievable acceptable levels. Technology including web service has assisted within customer service call center but with a reduced staff the call center will fall short of industry standards. Data will be submitted after close of month of July 2014 to determine what is the value of customer service to the City of Cincinnati. Data will be reviewed quarterly to assess service levels.

Recommendation 12: The Call Center should properly communicate CSR close-out processes to the coordinating departments.

Department Response: Somewhat Agree. The CSR system is a citywide system and tool for each department to use. CSR was designed for departments to open daily, perform tasks, track service requests and types along with reporting. As a real time system, departments then close out requests as to work performed or timelines in which it took to complete (Transfer to other departments, parts ordered, etc.). Reports are generated to show service levels for each type, neighborhood, division or department. These reports are viewed on a department or City administrative level. Public Services can assist in teaching how to close out service requests, but should be enforced by City administration by way of service levels by report.

Recommendation 13: The Call Center should periodically review service requests remaining open for extended periods of time and communicate with the coordinating department to determine the cause and correct the issue. Additionally, the reason for the delay should be documented, and delays should be routinely reported to management.

Department Response: Agree. Call center management can monitor such requests and forward requests that fall beyond acceptable thresholds. Again each department / division should monitor requests on a daily basis so that thresholds are not hit without a reason. Public Services will develop thresholds for service types as to assure prompt attention. Each Department and or Division can run reports weekly or even daily to see what is outstanding and

able to police themselves and report in real time what is or is not closed out. Customer service can run a period report as a backup to make sure nothing was missed. The Director of Public Services will have access to the CSR systems and all levels of reporting to add to the oversight process. This will be completed by 08.01.2014.

Recommendation 14: The Call Center should record complaints received from coordinating departments and ensure issues are resolved. The resolution should be properly communicated to the coordinating department.

Department Response: Agree with concern. Complaints that are transferred to other departments become the ownership of the accepting departments. CSR requests include a comment and timeline as to document what has transpired within the requests itself. Without constant supervision of all service requests, the only way would be to manually transfer the request and email city personnel and include documentation within the comment section of the request. Internal CSR complaints are regularly communicated with CAGIS as we currently update service requests. Completed 07.25.2014 - A complaint resolution file has been created.

Recommendation 15: The Call Center should implement a process to obtain updated CSR contacts from all coordinating departments, and update the CSR system.

Department Response: Agree. Public Services has already begun the process of updating CSR contacts for each city department. An annual communication will be issued at the request of the DPS Director to be updated and distributed to CSR users. The list can be compiled by Call Center staff and will be reviewed and completed by December 1, 2014.

Recommendation 16: The Call Center should ensure that the telephone management system has adequate data storage.

Department Response: Agree. The new call management system ASPECT being managed by CWW with an increased data capacity and historical range. Monthly and Annual reports will be documented and stored to assist both historical and future forecasting needs. The Cincinnati Water Works (CWW) will store data a total of 5 years with voice recordings for up to 3 years. This was considered acceptable by CWW. A final report will be run prior to the Avaya system server being shut down. This will be in place as 07.30.2014.

Note:

As it is important to maintain documentation for all public sector functions, we are currently limited to current staffing levels. I believe we can accomplish all recommendations within an acceptable time frame and look forward to providing documentation for future audit needs.