PRESENTATIONS

City Manager Performance Review Process

AGENDA

1-201901471  REPORT, dated 09/18/2019, submitted by Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager, regarding Comparing Cincinnati to Peer Cities' Line-of-Duty Fatalities' Data and Weekly Updates Relating to the City's Traffic Services Bureau. (SEE DOC. #201901175)

2-201901482  MOTION, submitted by Councilmembers Pastor and Young, WE MOVE that the Budget and Finance Committee meet at 1:00 p.m. on Monday of Week A of the City of Cincinnati Council calendar.

3-201901501  ORDINANCE (EMERGENCY), date 9/25/2019, submitted by Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager, AMENDING Articles II and IV of the Administrative Code of the City of Cincinnati, "City Manager" and "Departments of Police and Fire," respectively, to modify the tables of organization within the City Manager’s Office, Department of Police, and Department of Fire to provide that the Emergency Communications Center services and personnel be restored to the City Manager’s Office for purposes of supervision and administrative oversight; and to further provide that the Emergency Communications Center Director shall report directly to the City Manager.

4-201901522  REPORT, dated 10/1/2019, submitted by Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager, regarding OFDA responses to questions from Major Projects and Smart Government Committee.
To: Mayor and Members of City Council

From: Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager

Subject: Comparing Cincinnati to Peer Cities’ Line-Of-Duty Fatalities’ Data and Weekly Updates Relating to the City’s Traffic Services Bureau

Reference Document #201901175

On June 26, 2019, the Major Projects and Smart Government Committee referred the following for a report:

MOTION, submitted by Councilmembers Sittenfeld, Seelbach and Landsman, WE MOVE that the City of Cincinnati's employees are our most valuable resources and their safety is a paramount priority. WE MOVE that, following the tragic line-of-duty death of Mr. Leroy Garrison, Jr., the City Manager shall pursue the following steps: - Collect and provide data comparing line-of-duty fatalities in Cincinnati over the most recent 5-year and 10 year periods to our peer cities, adjusted for the size of each city's respective workforce. This data may also be broken down by public safety employees vs. non-public safety employees. - As has been done during the ongoing chapter of reform for the Emergency Communications Center, prepare to report to City Council each week at the regular full Council meetings with any updates on employee safety, specifically in the Department of Public Services. Further, if significant findings emerge from the PERRP investigation, or any of the City's internal investigations, those findings should be shared - as allowable - in real-time, rather than waiting until the conclusion of the investigations, so that related reforms can also be implemented in real-time. - Do not re-initiate non-emergency Electrical Maintenance work out of the Department of Public Services without first consulting with and informing the City Council - and only upon clear and evident proof that workers have been issued OSHA approved and recommended Personal Protective Equipment, including work clothing and tools. - Work collaboratively with the Collective Bargaining Units on the establishment of a standing Employee Safety Task Force. - Shift certain service-delivery functions to within a more appropriate City Department so as to provide the best possible supervisory oversight. - Seek assistance from outside entities in the industry to ensure best practice safety training for our employees.

The attached report is from the State of Ohio’s Bureau of Worker's Compensation Division of Safety & Hygiene, and details fatality statics of Cincinnati, Dayton, Cleveland, and Columbus over the last 5-years, broken down by public safety employees vs. non-public safety employees. In summary, from 2014 to present, the City of Cincinnati has had 3 employee fatalities; one in the Department of Public Services, one in the Cincinnati Police Department, and one in the Cincinnati Fire Department.

Also attached, are the weekly FYI Memos updating the Mayor and Council on employee safety, specifically relating to the Traffic Services Bureau.

Attachment
### Fatality Claim Counts - Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, and Dayton
#### 01/01/2014 to Present

**Date Run:** 7/30/2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Claim Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CINCINNATI</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAYTON</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLEVELAND</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLUMBUS</td>
<td>Non public safety employee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLUMBUS</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Generated By: [Cognos Package: General Reporting]

Report Name: Claims_Fatalities_Cinci_Dayton_Cleveland_Col_Since_2014_07-30-19

Report Path: [Report Created Date: Jul 30, 2019 9:53:00 AM]

Claim count by city and type

- **CINCINNATI**
  - Public safety employee: 3

- **DAYTON**
  - Public safety employee: 1

- **CLEVELAND**
  - Public safety employee: 2

- **COLUMBUS**
  - Public safety employee: 4

- Non public safety employee: 2

Public safety employee: 3
Fatality Claim Counts - Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, and Dayton
01/01/2014 to Present
Date Run 7/30/2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Injury Year</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Claim Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Non public safety employee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>Public safety employee</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Claim count by year and type

- Public safety employee
- Non public safety employee

Run Date: Jul 30, 2019 9:52:55 AM
Report Created Date: Jul 30, 2019 9:53:00 AM
Report Last Modified Date: Jul 30, 2019 9:53:00 AM
Fatality Claim Counts - Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, and Dayton
01/01/2014 to Present
Date Run 7/30/2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Claim Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CINCINNATI</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAYTON</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLEVELAND</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLUMBUS</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Claim count by city

- CINCINNATI: 3
- DAYTON: 1
- CLEVELAND: 2
- COLUMBUS: 6
Description:
The Bureau of Worker's Compensation Division of Safety & Hygiene received a public records request from the city of Cincinnati:

Our office is seeking statistics of line-of-duty fatalities across Cities in Ohio. Specifically, comparing stats of Cincinnati, Dayton, Cleveland, and Columbus over the last 5-years and if possible, broken down by public safety employees vs. non-public safety employees.

Methodologies:
Data warehouse queries were developed to identify and count fatality claims associated to the BWC policy number for each of these cities: Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, and Dayton, since 1/1/2014. Disallowed or duplicate claims were filtered out. From this data, routines were developed to count the results by city, year (based on date of injury), and type (public safety employee, or non-public safety employee), as well as year and type only.

Query Filters:
[Policy Number] in ('20005306', '35705102', '31805502', '32505302')
[Claim Combined Indicator] = 'n'
[Date of Occurrence] >= '2014-01-01'
[ Accident Category Name] = 'Death'
((Current Claim Status Type Name] = 'accepted'
 OR [ Current Claim Status Type Name] LIKE 'pending%'
 OR [ Current Claim Status Type Name] LIKE '%occurrence%'
AND ([Current Claim Status Reason Type Name] Not In ('dismissed', 'duplicate', 'denied', 'denied/appeal period', 'ag settlement', 'conversion'))
 OR ([Current Claim Status Reason Type Name] = 'Hearing'))

Notes:
We are aware of a recent fatality involving an electricity for a city of Cincinnati employee (probably "non public safety"). That instance is not yet appearing in our system and is therefore not included in these results.

These results contain a total of 12 fatalities that were found currently in the system according to the criteria listed above. The 3 subsequent tabs in this spreadsheet contain different groupings/views of the data.
Description:
The Bureau of Worker's Compensation Division of Safety & Hygiene received a public records request from the city of Cincinnati:

Our office is seeking statistics of line-of-duty fatalities across Cities in Ohio. Specifically, comparing stats of Cincinnati, Dayton, Cleveland, and Columbus over the last 5-years and if possible, broken down by public safety employees vs. non-public safety employees.

Methodologies:
Data warehouse queries were developed to identify and count fatality claims associated to the BWC policy number for each of these cities: Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, and Dayton, since 1/1/2014. Dis-allowed or duplicate claims were filtered out. From this data, routines were developed to count the results by city, year (based on date of injury), and type (public safety employee, or non-public safety employee), as well as year and type only.

Query Filters:
[Policy Number] in ('20005306', '35705102', '31805502', '32505302')
[Claim Combined Indicator] = 'n'
[Date of Occurrence] >= '2014-01-01'
[Accident Category Name] = 'Death'
(([[Current Claim Status Type Name] = 'accepted']
OR [Current Claim Status Type Name] LIKE 'pending%'
OR [Current Claim Status Type Name] LIKE '%occurrence%')
AND ((Current Claim Status Reason Type Name] Not In ('dismissed', 'duplicate', 'denied', 'denied/appeal period', 'aq settlement', 'conversion'))
OR (Current Claim Status Reason Type Name] = 'Hearing')

Notes:
We are aware of a recent fatality involving an electricution for a city of Cincinnati employee (probably "non public safety"). That instance is not yet appearing in our system and is therefore not included in these results.

These results contain a total of 12 fatalities that were found currently in the system according to the criteria listed above. The 3 subsequent tabs in this spreadsheet contain different groupings/views of the data.
FOR YOUR INFORMATION

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager
Subject: TSB Evaluation/Review Update

This memo serves as an update to the Administration's ongoing review of the City's Traffic Service Bureau (TSB) and the policies and procedures related to their work.

Policy Review
In conjunction with Risk Management, the Administration has finalized a written program on Electrical Safety specifically designed for TSB work and the staff performing that work. The program, written in accordance with OSHA mandates, outlines responsibilities, training requirements, and required safety procedures and protocols for individual work types. A comprehensive training on the new program is currently being scheduled for all TSB employees.

A Citywide written program on the Control of Hazardous Energy is already in existence. However, the TSB document is tailored to the specific types of work performed by TSB staff. Once training on the TSB program is complete, the Administration will turn its attention to tailoring policies for each department that conducts electrical work.

Other Trainings
Various enhanced trainings for TSB are either underway or will begin in the next few weeks. Duke Energy provided a live wire demonstration for TSB staff earlier today. Several days of controlled hazard training are set to begin Monday, July 15. The sessions will consist of training for both low-voltage and high-voltage situations. Two days of advanced bucket truck training will take place the week of July 22. As mentioned previously, the initial first aid and CPR training began two weeks ago and should wrap-up soon.

In addition to TSB staff, leadership from the Department of Public Services (DPS) and the Department of Transportation and Engineering (DOTE) have been and will continue to be in attendance at these various trainings.

Safety Equipment
DPS leadership is working on the procurement of various new pieces of Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) for each TSB staff member. This will include a mixture of clothing and apparatus as well as new insulated tools. The purchasing process is underway.

cc: Deborah Allison, Risk Manager
Jerry Wilkerson, Director, Public Services
John Brazina, Acting Director, Transportation and Engineering
For Your Information

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager
Subject: TSB Evaluation/Review Update

The purpose of this memo is to provide an update on efforts by the Administration to enhance the Traffic Service Bureau (TSB). This process has included a thorough examination of the policies and procedures guiding the TSB, enhanced hands-on trainings for TSB staff, and an overall evaluation of the structural organization of the TSB. The Administration is also moving forward on a Citywide level with implementation and training on the new “Work Alone” policy.

Below is a breakdown on specific elements of this review process.

Structural Reorganization and Staffing
Leadership from both the Departments of Public Services (DPS) and Transportation & Engineering (DOTE) continue discussions regarding the relocation of TSB to DOTE, as well as the associated costs and job responsibilities related to such a move. These talks have largely focused on the organizational and financial impacts to both departments, primarily staffing considerations, operational enhancements, and immediate and future budgetary impacts. One such consideration is expanding the staffing complement for TSB’s third shift. Risk Management also suggests that TSB consults with an Electrical Engineer; exploration on this recommendation is occurring. The shift of management of TSB from DPS to DOTE is scheduled for August.

All non-emergency TSB remains suspended as the evaluation is ongoing. The Administration continues to explore possibilities for onboarding a vendor(s) to assist in the interim to ensure the workload does not fall too far out of cycle. Maintaining an ongoing contract with a vendor to perform as-needed work on behalf of the City is being explored as well.

Involvement of TSB Staff
The Administration has attempted to be as transparent and inclusive as possible during this evaluation process; it has been important to have all affected parties at the table including TSB staff themselves. Departmental leadership recently met with TSB staff to provide them with a status update and solicit feedback on potential process improvements and/or operational concerns. Staff has already identified several suggestions including implementing across-the-board, hands-on (re-)training to ensure all current TSB staff have a comprehensive understanding of all aspects of the TSB workload. Other suggestions include updating circuit drawings for lighting work and more prominently displaying voltage limitations on the buckets of individual aerial trucks.
Meetings with representatives from the affected labor organizations have taken place as well.

**Other Ongoing Trainings**

Various trainings for TSB are taking place this week, including two sessions of advanced bucket truck/aerial truck training (July 23-24). Additionally, the Employee Safety section of Risk Management began train-the-trainer sessions on the new Citywide "Working Alone Safety Policy." Every department that has employees who work alone must have their safety representatives and HR liaisons attend the training. It is then the responsibility of the departmental safety representatives and HR liaisons to work together to train their staff. The purpose of the new policy is to encourage awareness and promote safe work procedures for employees who work alone. The training includes a session on how to perform a risk assessment.

Risk assessments are used to identify hazards associated with job tasks and control measures to reduce or eliminate the risk to the employee. Both the risk assessment and the training will identify specific job tasks where employees should never work alone. Employee Safety also recommends that departments that have employees who work alone develop a standard operation procedure (SOP) for communicating with the lone workers throughout the day.

**Equipment**

All recommended Personal Protective Equipment (PPE), locks and insulated tools have been purchased and assigned to staff. Purchasing is in the process of finalizing and recommending a vendor to provide safety uniforms on a rental basis. These purchases are being made with the understanding that additional staffing and budgetary allocation decisions may need to be made in the coming weeks.

cc: Karen Alder, Interim Director, Finance  
    Deborah Allison, Risk Manager  
    Jerry Wilkerson, Director, Public Services  
    John Brazina, Interim Director, Transportation and Engineering
FOR YOUR INFORMATION

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager
Subject: TSB Evaluation/Enhancements Update

The purpose of this memo is to provide an update on efforts by the City Administration to evaluate and enhance the Traffic Services Bureau (TSB) and the service it provides. The Department of Public Services (DPS), the Department of Transportation and Engineering (DOTE), Risk Management and the City Manager’s Office have worked diligently to evaluate policies and procedures, trainings and organizational structures related to the TSB to better complement the unique needs of the bureau and enhance overall employee safety.

Below is a continued breakdown of the specific elements:

**Transition Plan and Staffing**
The formal transition of TSB from DPS to DOTE will take place on August 11. TSB will transition to the Division of Traffic Engineering within DOTE.

DOTE is in the process of evaluating work crew assignments for the TSB. This information will play a key role in determining future staffing needs, as well as what level of workload the TSB will be able to accomplish.

As part of the transition process, DPS is evaluating the impact the organizational shift will have on its operations, especially winter operations as TSB drivers doubled as snowplow drivers. DPS is in ongoing discussions with DOTE and other City departments that utilize CDL drivers to evaluate the potential of sharing resources when the need arises. The Department of Human Resources is in the process of hiring a CDL/Heavy Equipment Trainer which should help as well. Labor representation will be included as these discussions progress.

Additional staffing updates including onboarding two new Employee Safety employees who will start next week. One is a Senior Safety Specialist transferring from MSD and the other is a Safety Specialist who is being hired from outside the City.

**TSB Workload**
DOTE is in the process of developing a report on realistic expectations for work output based on current staffing levels. That report is expected to be presented to the City Manager’s Office for review in the next few weeks. The City Manager’s Office will use that information to develop a recommendation for Council about potential next steps and related budgetary considerations.
Training

Training for TSB staff, Human Resources personnel and Safety representatives continues. HR and Safety reps for all City departments recently completed “work alone” training. Those individuals are now in the process of working with their respective staffs to develop Risk Assessments specifically tailored to the positions that may be required to work alone. These assessments are due by August 30; Risk Management will monitor the timeline to ensure assessments are submitted and then follow up as necessary.

Bucket truck training was recently completed and reportedly went very well. TSB staff also recently completed CPR training offered by the Cincinnati Fire Department. The City is utilizing a vendor to provide follow-up first-aid training and certification over the next few weeks.

Risk Management staff continues to work on the development of a hands-on educational program that will provide enhanced, scenario-based training opportunities. This simulation-style training will be similar to the “in-service” training currently utilized by the Cincinnati Police Department. The goal will be to ensure these trainings are offered to new employees, employees identified as in need of retraining, and as part of a regular inspection process.
FOR YOUR INFORMATION

TO: Mayor and Members of Council

FROM: Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager

SUBJECT: TSB Staffing Changes

As you know, the organizational relocation of the Traffic Services Bureau (TSB) from the Department of Public Services (DPS) to the Department of Transportation and Engineering occurred on August 11. This was done to better align workflow and improve operational efficiencies as most electrical maintenance work orders originate in DOTE.

Attached you will find a comprehensive report on the status of that restructuring including the impact on current staffing, workload analysis, and the budgetary impact of these operational changes. Based on the review and analysis, as well as recent changes in the City's safety policies, several recommendations are provided. These recommendations are designed to enhance the safety of field crews and ensure the TSB can accomplish its current workload after implementation of the enhanced safety policies.

Relocation of the existing components of the TSB can be accomplished in a budget-neutral manner; however, some of the transition requires a reallocation of funds from existing sources. After consultation with the affected departments and the Office of Budget and Evaluation, the Administration recommends the use of a portion of the additional gasoline tax revenue to be collected starting in Fiscal Year 2020. That revenue is deposited into the Street Construction, Maintenance and Repair Fund from which expenses for traffic signal operation and maintenance are eligible. Any other funding plan would require either cutting services elsewhere or identifying a new funding source(s).

The Administration is preparing an Ordinance for the Mayor's consideration for referral and Council's approval that addresses this funding. It is important to note that passage of this Ordinance and usage of gasoline tax revenue in this manner would affect the ability of DPS to perform some enhancements outlined in the Approved FY 2020 Budget related to the maintenance and repair of the City's street system. The Administration will provide a more detailed update on the impact when, and if, the Ordinance is passed.

It is important to note that additional funding, however, will be needed, in subsequent fiscal years (FY) (e.g., FY 2021, FY 2022, etc.), in order to achieve the planned enhancements to the TSB to ensure employee safety is maintained while we achieve the productivity levels necessary to maintain these critical public safety assets.

The Ordinance is expected to be presented to Council in early September with a planned effective date of September 22, 2019.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Attachment

cc: John Brazina, Interim Director, Department of Transportation and Engineering
To: Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager
From: John S. Brazina, Interim Director, Transportation and Engineering
Subject: TRAFFIC SERVICES BUREAU – STAFFING NEEDS AND BUDGET IMPACTS

This memo details the current staffing and workload for the Traffic Services Bureau (TSB). Based on a review of the current staffing, the existing workload, and changes in the City’s safety policies, several recommendations are provided. These recommendations are designed to enhance the TSB field crews by increasing the FTE count needed to accomplish the current workload within the context of the City’s revised safety policies.

EXISTING STAFFING
The current staffing level for the TSB include 29 filled positions. This includes: 3.0 FTE Service Area Coordinator (SAC), 1.0 FTE Engineering Technician 4, 3.0 FTE Engineering Technician, 8.0 FTE Electrical Maintenance Worker 2, 7.0 FTE Electrical Maintenance Worker 1, 4.0 FTE Electrical Maintenance Worker Helper, 1.0 FTE Supervising Storekeeper, 1.0 FTE Storekeeper and 1.0 FTE Laborer.

WORKLOAD ANALYSIS
The TSB is tasked with a variety of responsibilities, including:
- Emergency repairs of streetlight or traffic signal outages
- Work Orders from the Department of Transportation & Engineering (DOTE)
- Preventive Maintenance (PM) on traffic signals and street lighting
- Maintenance work (e.g. customer service requests, permanent accident repairs, etc.)
- Winter Operations assistance
- Underground marking of TSB maintained electrical utilities for Ohio Utilities Protection Service (OUPS)
- Maintenance responsibility via contract for State-owned lighting within City limits
- Work Performed for the Cincinnati Police Department (CPD), the Cincinnati Parks Department, the Cincinnati Recreation Commission (CRC), Fleet Services, etc., including police camera installation & maintenance and lighting work for Parks and Fleet. This work is reimbursed through inter-departmental (ID) bills.

A review of the workload data for the TSB demonstrates that a backlog of work is being generated in two important areas:

DOTE Issued Work Orders
From 2016-2018, DOTE issued an average of 240 work orders annually. In 2018, the TSB was only able to complete 91% of the DOTE issued work orders. Currently, there are:
- 84 outstanding work orders from previous years (2018 and earlier)
- 11 outstanding work orders from 2019
Preventive Maintenance (PM) on Traffic Signals

There are 786 traffic intersections in the City of Cincinnati that need PM on an annual basis. From 2016-2018, TSB was only able to complete about 35% of this total. A three-year history of PM data demonstrates the backlog that has accrued in this service area:

- 2018: 278 of 786 (35%) PM completed
- 2017: 301 of 786 (38%) PM completed
- 2016: 206 of 786 (26%) PM completed

In short, the TSB’s current staffing level has not been able to complete its annual workload, resulting in a backlog in the area of work orders and preventive maintenance.

Furthermore, this workload backlog is an impediment to the TSB implementing new PM standards. For perspective on what is considered best practice for PM on traffic signals, information is provided from the City of Columbus and the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT).

The City of Columbus is responsible for 1,006 traffic signals. They inspect 225 signals on a 4.5-year inspection cycle and complete a controller program evaluation and conflict monitor test on all 1,006 traffic signals annually. The City of Columbus spends approximately 10-man hours between two different groups (a line crew and an electronics crew) on these tasks. The City of Columbus indicated that they do not have a true PM program, but address issues that are found via inspections, citizen requests, or items identified by engineering staff. They struggle with embedded poles and perform as many rebuilds and new intersections as the City of Cincinnati does using in-house forces. At ODOT, they have the resources to inspect all 1,450 signals that are the State’s responsibility on an annual basis. The ODOT inspections are briefer than the City of Columbus inspections. The TSB PM activities more closely mirror what the City of Columbus does rather than what ODOT does.

DOTE is in the process of revising the annual goals for PM on traffic signals. For FY 2020, the revised TSB goals are:

- Complete a conflict monitor and programming check on all 786 intersections.
- Begin a 3-year full PM cycle with the goal of 262 (1/3 of 786) intersections per year.

These PM goals are designed to be better aligned with other cities in our region.

Further exacerbating the problem in the City of Cincinnati is the fact that much of the traffic signal and lighting infrastructure is beyond its useful life. For example, 58% of the City’s traffic signals have a condition rating of poor or worse with a replacement value of $92 million and are at the end of their useful service life. PM is critical to maintaining these assets given the scarcity of capital budget resources needed for replacement.

Finally, with the implementation of the City’s revised safety policies and procedures (e.g. working alone and two person crews), it is anticipated that the TSB’s productivity will be adversely affected.

To summarize, the TSB has a current backlog of work. That backlog will continue to increase as additional PM needs arise, as new PM standards are implemented, and as revised City safety policies are implemented.

PROPOSED SOLUTION

Current staffing levels for the TSB are insufficient and have directly resulted in a workload backlog. In order to address this issue, an increase in the number of full-time employees (FTE) is necessary.
Field Crew Staffing
There are 37 positions on the TSB field crew organizational chart; however, only 30 positions are filled. Additionally, one of the employees is off work on a long-term leave, effectively leaving 29 employees to perform all TSB work.

Data suggests that if all 34 positions were filled and all employees were available to work, the annual workload could be completed using current crew assignments and after-hours call-out procedures. However, the immediate implementation of the City’s revised safety policies and procedures requires DOTE to rearrange crew assignments and after-hours call-out procedures. For these reasons additional FTEs are needed in order to fulfill the entire TSB workload.

DOTE anticipates that 11 new field crew FTEs are needed to implement the revised safety policies and procedures as well as establish a non-standard shift to ensure full 24-hour coverage daily. The FTEs include: 4.0 FTE Engineering Technician 3 and 7.0 FTE Electrical Maintenance Worker 2. The annual budget impact of Field Crew Staffing is $1,045,000.

Given the hiring process and the training required for new TSB employees, it is unlikely that TSB can have fully staffed and trained field crews until FY 2022. An employee that is hired as an Electrical Maintenance Worker 2 (EMW2) starts as a Helper (EMWh). After a minimum of 1 year working as a Helper and obtaining a CDL, the employee becomes an Electrical Maintenance Worker 1 (EMW1). After a minimum of 2 years and passing probation, the employee becomes an EMW2. Onboarding the new EMWh employees takes time before they can start working on the crews doing electrical work primarily due to mandatory safety training. The EMWh need to shadow the more experienced employees which is the reason for staggering the hiring of the EMWh. In the interim, TSB would utilize on-call contractors to complete the TSB annual workload.

### Ability to Complete TSB Annual Workload at Various Staffing Levels*
(chart does not include the 3.0 FTE Service Area Coordinator (SAC) and existing admin staff)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Staff of 23</th>
<th>Emergency Repairs</th>
<th>DOTE Work Orders</th>
<th>PM</th>
<th>Maintenance</th>
<th>Winter Operation</th>
<th>OUPS Marking</th>
<th>Maintenance for State-Owned Lighting</th>
<th>ID Bill Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff of 31</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff of 42</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*For additional information on man hours per task, please see the attached appendix.

Administrative Staffing
In order to provide the necessary oversight of TSB functions, additional administrative staff will be required. The FTEs include: 1.0 FTE Supervising Engineer, 1.0 FTE Senior Engineer, and 1.0 FTE Accounting Technician 2. The Supervising Engineer will supervise the field crews, the Senior Engineer (Electrical) is recommended by Risk Management to help with process improvement, environmental safety review including code compliance review, and to supervise staff; and the Accounting Technician 2 will help with payroll and other accounting responsibilities for TSB. The annual budget impact of the additional administrative staff is $370,000.
Non-Personnel Needs
Any new hires for the TSB, will require non-personnel resources to provide the proper training and equipment for each employee. Some capital fleet equipment and specialized equipment may also be necessary. A summary of those items follows:

Training and Equipment
These costs include Personal Protective Equipment (PPE), training, and insulated tools. The estimated cost is $6,000 per employee, for a total of $84,000.

Fleet Equipment
With additional staffing, the TSB will require two (2) additional 37' Bucket Trucks in order to fully and efficiently utilize the additional personnel. These vehicles cost approximately $150,000 each, for a total of $300,000. All other existing vehicles can be shared between the different shifts.

Specialized Equipment
1. Controller Test Displays are needed in order to become compliant with the new TSB Electrical Safety Program. The current test displays are non-compliant as energized components are exposed. The controller shop uses the test displays for bench testing intersection controller equipment. Twelve (12) Controller Test Displays will allow each Controller Shop employee to utilize one (1) at their test benches and the three (3) additional displays would be used to test the controller assemblies that the City supplies for new intersection installations. The cost for each is $680, for a total of $8,160.

2. TSB needs two (2) arrow boards for maintenance of traffic when working on signal and lighting facilities. TSB currently borrows arrow boards from the Department of Public Services (DPS). The cost for each is approximately $5,000, for a total of $10,000.

3. TSB needs a total of three (3) Scorpion trailer attenuators. The current allotment is two (2), but both of those are damaged and need to be replaced. These are used for crash protection when crews are working in the roadway on signal and lighting facilities. The cost for each is approximately $25,000, for a total of $75,000.

All three of the above specialized equipment items are considered safety critical.

SUMMARY OF BUDGET IMPACT
The staffing plan for FY 2020 includes filling the existing seven vacant field crew positions to reach a staffing level of 34 employees. DOTE will also request to fill the proposed administrative staff positions to keep up with safety requirements. As previously mentioned, DOTE will utilize contractors to manage the workload as needed to help eliminate the current backlog of work until full staffing is reached. DOTE will continue to fill proposed positions in FY 2021 and FY 2022 resulting in less work being performed by contractors each fiscal year. By FY 2023, DOTE should be fully staffed and need little or no contract work for the TSB.

Budget Summary
FY 2020:
Personnel costs: Fill the 7 field crew vacancies (already included in the FY 2020 budget) and the 3 new administrative staff FTE with benefits cost $370,000.
Capital: Equipment cost $93,160
Non-personnel costs: $42,000 – training for the 7 field crew employees
Contract work: $500,000
Total: $1,005,160 Additional
FY 2021:
Field crews: The 7 new field crew FTE with benefits cost $650,000.
Non-personnel costs: $42,000
Contract work: $500,000
Total: $1,192,000 Additional

FY 2022:
Field crews: The 4 new field crew FTE with benefits cost $395,000.
Capital: Fleet cost $300,000
Non-personnel costs: $24,000
Contract work: $200,000
Total: $919,000 Additional
September 16, 2019

MOTION

WE MOVE that the Budget and Finance Committee meet at 1:00pm on Monday of Week A of the City of Cincinnati Council calendar:

Councilmember Jeff Pastor

Councilmember [Signature]

COMMITTEES

Chair: Neighborhoods     Member: Budget & Finance • Economic Growth & Zoning • Law & Public Safety
TO: Mayor and Members of City Council
FROM: Patrick A. Duhaney, City Manager
SUBJECT: Emergency Ordinance—Amending the Administrative Code to Restore Emergency Communications Center to the City Manager's Office

Transmitted herewith is an emergency ordinance captioned as follows:

AMENDING Articles II and IV of the Administrative Code of the City of Cincinnati, "City Manager" and "Departments of Police and Fire," respectively, to modify the tables of organization within the City Manager's Office, Department of Police, and Department of Fire to provide that the Emergency Communications Center services and personnel be restored to the City Manager's Office for purposes of supervision and administrative oversight; and to further provide that the Emergency Communications Center Director shall report directly to the City Manager.

Between 2010 to 2015 command of the Emergency Communications Center was transferred to a civilian model. In 2015, it returned to a paramilitary command model, again supervised by Police and Fire. In June 2018, operations of the ECC transitioned to a civilian-managed department under the auspices of the City Manager’s Office. The Fire/EMS dispatchers assigned to ECC continue to report to Cincinnati Fire Department; however, the ECC is currently overseen by a Special Projects Manager, who reports to the City Manager.

This ordinance formally reestablishes command of the Emergency Communications Center under the supervision and administrative oversight of the City Manager’s Office.
AMENDING Articles II and IV of the Administrative Code of the City of Cincinnati, "City Manager" and "Departments of Police and Fire," respectively, to modify the tables of organization within the City Manager's Office, Department of Police, and Department of Fire to provide that the Emergency Communications Center services and personnel be restored to the City Manager's Office for purposes of supervision and administrative oversight; and to further provide that the Emergency Communications Center Director shall report directly to the City Manager.

WHEREAS, for purposes of operational efficiency within the City of Cincinnati, it is appropriate to transfer the responsibility for administrative oversight of the Emergency Communications Center from the Cincinnati Police Department to the City Manager's Office and to reestablish an "Emergency Communications Center Division" within the City Manager's Office; and

WHEREAS, the director of the Emergency Communications Center Division shall be responsible for managing the consolidated emergency communications functions of the City of Cincinnati Police and Fire Departments and shall report directly to the City Manager; and

WHEREAS, the personnel serving in the Emergency Communications Center are currently located on the table of organization of the Cincinnati Police Department; now, therefore,

BE IT ORDAINED by the Council of the City of Cincinnati, State of Ohio, three-fourths of the members elected to Council concurring:

Section 1. That Article II of the Administrative Code, "City Manager," is hereby amended by enactment of a new Section 23, "Emergency Communications Center Division," as follows:

ARTICLE II. - CITY MANAGER

Sec. 23. - Emergency Communications Center Division.

There is hereby established within the office of the city manager an emergency communications center division to be administered by a director who shall direct, control, and supervise all officers and employees within the emergency communications center division and shall be responsible for managing the consolidated emergency
communications functions of the police and fire departments, including overall administration of incoming service calls managed by the emergency communications center. The emergency communications center director shall be appointed by and under the supervision of the city manager.

Section 2. That Article IV, Section 2, “Chief of Police,” of the Administrative Code is hereby amended as follows:

Sec. 2. - Chief of Police.

The chief of police shall be the director and commanding officer of the police department and, subject to the approval of the city manager, shall have control of the assignment and stationing of the members of the police department and the direction of the police work of the city. The office of the chief of police shall be subject to the control, direction and supervision of the city manager.

The chief of police also shall have responsibility for operational oversight of an emergency communications center including overall administration of incoming service calls managed by the emergency communications center for the dispatch functions of the police and fire departments. The chief of police shall work closely with the fire chief and designated representatives of the police and fire departments to ensure efficient operation of the emergency communications center on behalf of the police and fire departments and the Cincinnati community. The police and fire chiefs shall maintain collaborative managerial oversight of dispatch services within their specific areas of service.

Section 3. That Article IV, Section 6, “Fire Chief,” of the Administrative Code is hereby amended as follows:

Sec. 6. - Fire Chief.

The fire chief shall be the director and commanding officer of the fire department, and, subject to the approval of the city manager, shall have control of the assigning and stationing of the members of the fire department and the direction of the work thereof. The office of the fire chief shall be subject to the control, direction and supervision of the city manager.

The fire chief shall work closely with the director of the emergency communications center, the police chief and designated representatives of the police and fire departments to ensure efficient operation of the emergency communications center on behalf of the police and fire departments and the Cincinnati community. The director of the emergency communications center and the fire chiefs shall maintain collaborative managerial oversight of dispatch services within their specific areas of service.
Section 4. That the City of Cincinnati personnel currently within the Emergency Communications Center division of the Police Department shall be transferred to the Emergency Communications Center division of the City Manager's Office.

Section 5. That this ordinance shall be an emergency measure necessary for the preservation of the public peace, health, safety, and general welfare and shall, subject to the terms of Article II, Section 6 of the Charter, be effective immediately. The reason for the emergency is the immediate need to modify the tables of organization within the City Manager's office and the Police and Fire Departments for purposes of administrative efficiency and enhanced public safety.

Passed: _______________________, 2019

____________________________________
John Cranley, Mayor

Attest: _____________________________
Clerk

New language underscored. Deletions indicated by strike-through.
This report provides responses to questions from City Council during the Major Projects and Smart Government Committee meeting held on September 17, 2019. At this meeting, the Office of Performance & Data Analytics presented “Special Events Permitting Portal,” during which the following questions were asked.

**Question 1.** What Special Event fees are currently charged to Community Councils by department?

**Response 1.** Events sponsored by a Community Council, Neighborhood Business Association, or Community Development Corporation are charged a $50 fee for the Special Event Permit, a 90% discount of the standard $500 fee. The Special Event Permit is the only permit that provides a discounted rate to the above organizations.

The Cincinnati Park Board recently adopted a new fee waiver policy that allows community councils based on set criteria, attached.

**Question 2.** What activates an insurance requirement for a special event?

**Response 2.** All events that trigger a Special Event Permit (attendance greater than 3,000) or Parade Permit from Cincinnati Police Department must obtain insurance. Additionally, events serving alcohol or that incorporate motor vehicles require insurance. If an event producer has any specific questions regarding their event they can contact Risk Management for additional information at 513-352-2418.

**Question 3.** Who is eligible for the Invest in Neighborhoods insurance aggregate?

**Response 3.** Currently only Community Councils are eligible to participate in the insurance aggregate. For more information please contact Elizabeth Bartley, Director of Invest in Neighborhoods, at bartley@investinneighborhoods.com.

Attachment

cc: Nicollellette Staton, Director & Chief Performance Officer, Office of Performance & Data Analytics
Special Use Permit Fee Waiver Policy

Policy Purpose
Cincinnati Parks recognizes the importance of supporting community events, programs and celebrations providing a community benefit and improving overall cultural connection and enrichment opportunities for the Cincinnati community. The purpose of this policy is to set forth guidelines and criteria governing the special use fee waiver process necessary to encourage and support local special events, community projects, or programs occurring within Cincinnati Parks. The Cincinnati Parks Riverfront Parks & Special Events Division Manager shall serve as the administrator for this program and will account for tracking special event fee waivers and amounts.

Eligibility
1. Cincinnati Parks may grant special use permit fee waivers to an event producing organization/individual for educational, fundraiser, cultural/art, community service, athletic/sports programs, and Cincinnati Parks/City of Cincinnati Departmental use as defined in the definitions section of this policy. Events/programs not meeting the objectives identified within these definitions will not be eligible for fee waiver funding.

2. Cincinnati Parks will not grant special use permit fee waivers to:
   
a. Any religion, church, creed, or sectarian organization if the intent of the program is to promote religious purposes. (Religious organizations are not excluded from fee waivers; however, the purpose of the program must be as described in the definitions section of this policy and shall not serve to promote a religious message as the primary purpose). Religious organizations are not eligible for fee waivers for fundraising programs.

b. Political organizations and individual political campaigns.

c. Organizations that discriminate on the basis of race, gender, age, color, religion, disability status, marital status, sexual orientation or transgender status, or ethnic, national or Appalachian regional origin are not eligible for special use permit fee waivers.

3. Events eligible for a special use permit fee waiver should be open to the public.

4. For-profit organizations are not eligible for fee waivers for promotional programs for which the organization/corporation or its employees or officers will gain personal benefit/profit (i.e., a sales promotion).
Process
An event producing organization/individual requesting a fee waiver must complete the Special Use Permit Fee Waiver application and submit it to the Cincinnati Parks Riverfront Parks & Special Events Section. Applications should be received at least 60-days prior to the event/program date.

Application Review and Approval
Fee waiver applications should be submitted in person or electronically. Applications will be submitted to the Special Use Permit Fee Waiver Review Committee. The Committee is made up of Cincinnati Park staff who understand the value of community-based events and programs as well as special event permitting requirements. Upon review, the committee will provide a recommendation to the Cincinnati Parks Director who will ultimately grant or deny an application for fee waiver.

Approval Authority
The granting of fee waivers will be determined by the Cincinnati Parks Director, based on the recommendation of the Special Use Permit Fee Waiver Committee. It is at the sole discretion of the Parks Director to make any exceptions to the eligibility requirements of this policy.

Participation Requirements
If granted a fee waiver, the event/program organization must also agree to do the following:

a. Obtain all required permits, in compliance with the Cincinnati Parks Special Use Permit policy (Park Board Rule 29) and City of Cincinnati Code of Ordinances.

b. When desired by Cincinnati Parks, acknowledge the support of Cincinnati Parks and include the Cincinnati Parks logo on all printed information and advertising related to the event for which the fee waiver was granted.

c. Event producing organization/individual(s) will volunteer community service hours for the benefit of Cincinnati Parks commiserate with the monetary value of the fees waived. Required volunteer hours will be determined and tracked by the Cincinnati Parks Volunteer Coordinator and must be completed within 6 months of the event.

Definitions
Event/Program: A celebration, special event, fundraiser, athletic, cultural, community service, educational activity or benefitting Cincinnati Parks or a City of Cincinnati Department as further described below.

a. Athletic/Sports Event – Recreational athletics/sports events which are open to the general public for participation and which serve participants of multiple ages groups or categories.
b. **Educational Programs** — Community programs which contribute to improved education of Cincinnati’s citizens.

c. **Cultural/Art Programs** — Community programs held for the sole purpose of exposing the public to cultural enrichment, nature programming or public entertainment.

d. **Fundraiser Programs** — Community programs held for the primary purpose of raising funds for a non-profit organization and for which other intrinsic cultural, athletic, entertainment, or educational value is provided for the benefit of the public.

e. **Community Service** — Programs held, at no charge to attendees, for primary purpose of providing free services and information for the betterment of the community.

f. **Parks/City Department** — Events/programs held by or benefitting a City of Cincinnati Department or for the enrichment of Cincinnati Parks including landscape, design, preservation, natural resources, stewardship, maintenance, beautification, horticulture/arboriculture, greenways and trails.

**Fee waiver:** The waiver of special use permit and associated staffing and clean up fees normally paid to Cincinnati Parks.
SPECIAL USE PERMIT FEE WAIVER APPLICATION

Cincinnati Parks recognizes the importance of supporting community events, programs and celebrations providing a community benefit and improving overall cultural connection and enrichment opportunities for the Cincinnati community. Eligible Event producing organization/individual(s) should submit this Special Use Permit Fee Waiver application to the Riverfront Parks & Special Events Section of Cincinnati Parks, no less than sixty (60) days, and no more than one year, before the event/program.

Event/Program Information

Event name: ________________________________________________________
Event producing organization/individual name: ____________________________
Event date: ________________ Expected number of participants: _______________
Event Location/Facility/Park: ____________________________________________
Will this event/program be open to the general public? □ Yes □ No
Will this event/program charge admission, parking, and/or similar fees? □ Yes □ No
If yes, describe type of fees and amount: __________________________________

Organization Information

Event producing organization/individual name: ____________________________
If an organization, please provide mission statement: _________________________
_____________________________________________________________________
_____________________________________________________________________
Are any other organizations collaborating on this event/program?
_____________________________________________________________________
_____________________________________________________________________

Event History

How many/what years has this event/program occurred? _______________________
Has it previously occurred in a Cincinnati Park? □ Yes □ No
If yes, when? _______________________________________________________
Has the event/program received a Cincinnati Parks fee waiver previously? □ Yes □ No
If yes, when: _______________________________________________________

{00261408-2}
Purpose, Impact, Benefit of the Event/Program

Circle the category best describing your event/program:

Athletic/Sports  
Fundraiser

Educational  
Community Service

Cultural/Art  
Parks/City Department

How would you describe the purpose of the event/program?

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

What is the event/program’s expected community impact and benefit?

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

I am attaching an event/program flyer/poster (previous year if current is not available) □ Yes  □ No

PLEASE READ CAREFULLY & SIGN BELOW

If the Cincinnati Parks elects to waive the event/program special use permit fees, I agree to follow all guidelines and conditions outlined in the Special Events Fee Waiver Policy.

I certify that the information contained on this application is true and correct to the best of my knowledge. I certify that I have read and have full comprehension of the Special Use Fee Waiver Policy.

Printed name: ____________________________________________________________
Affiliation/Position with Event Producing Organization: __________________________
Mobile Phone:________________________ Email:______________________________
Signature:__________________________ Date: ________________________________

Administrative Use Only:
Committee Date: __________________________ □ Recommended  □ Not Recommended
Approved: ____________________________  
   Wade Walcutt, Director

{00261408-2}