City of Cincinnati
Gender Study

Presentation for
EIYA Committee
by
UC Gender Equity Research Team
College of Arts & Sciences
Beyond other cities forCEDAW studies.
Research informed by and extending
qualitative elements.

Study which involves qualitative &
mixed-method

Two-Year (2017-2019)

Introduction: Study Overview
Quantitative Elements

- “Rough cut” analysis of gender and race breakdowns of City of Cincinnati employees per department and in appointments to boards & commissions, including gender wage gap(s), based on HR-provided data
- Determine 4-5 “deep-dive” departments (based on thematic criteria of health, economics, and safety; gender criteria of female-dominated, gender neutral, and male-dominated; and significant enough size)
- Conduct online surveys of employees in identified “deep dive” departments to refine demographic data/variable controls and determine job satisfaction and opportunities for advancement by gender (in combination with race)
- Conduct network analysis
Qualitative Elements

- “Rough cut” comparisons of department budgets and missions by gender make-up.
- “Deep-dive” departments research: textual analysis of missions, strategic plans, job announcements, etc.; gender-responsive budget analysis; and post-survey interviews of employees to further identify gender (in combination with race) bias in hiring, budgeting, and programming.
- Final focus groups within “deep dive” departments to encourage further self-study and recommended improvements.
Quantitative Analysis: Step 1

- Evaluate average pay differences between male and female employees across all departments
- Accounting for various factors
  - Job title
  - Education
  - Race
  - Full-time vs. part-time
Summary of Preliminary Findings

Overall, on average, male employees make 10 cents less per hour than female employees make. Overall, on average, black employees make 12 cents less per hour than white employees.
Quantitative Analysis: Step 2

- Establish percentage of male vs. female workers within each department
- Establish average pay differences between male and female workers within each department
- Evaluate average pay differences between male and female employees within each department accounting for various factors
Results

- Demographics
  - 11 of the 21 City Departments are at least 60% men.
  - 6 of the 21 City Departments are at least 60% women.
- Pay
  - Males make more in 16 of 21 City Departments
  - Controlling for other factors, male pay bias is found in 6 out of 21 City Departments
- Lessons
  - Men tend to be overrepresented
  - Men tend to make more on average, but this effect decreases when we adjust for job title, education, etc.
  - This variation leads us to believe that women tend to not be in higher paying positions.
- Number of Employees
- Female-Dominated, Neutral, and Male-Dominated
- Gender Criteria
- Health, Economics, and Safety

Department Choices
## Recommended Departments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Prop. Male</th>
<th>Pay Gap: M-F</th>
<th>F/Pay relationship</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PROPOSED “DEEP DIVE” DEPARTMENTS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health-Related</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Department</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>9.86</td>
<td>Male Bias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics-Related</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community &amp; Econ. Dev.</td>
<td>.60</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>Female Bias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Planning</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety-Related</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>.93</td>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>Male Bias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>5.84</td>
<td>Female Bias</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Survey Overview

- Conduct Initial Online Survey (early/mid-April 2018)
- Multiple Rounds
  - 2-3 times
- Demographic Variables
  - Age, race, gender, marriage status, sexuality, immigration status, children, veteran status, education, position, supervisor status, represented/non-represented/code status, etc.
- Network Variables
  - Friendship, leadership, advice
- Job Satisfaction Variables
  - Raises, happiness, perceived advancement opportunities, respect of co-workers, professionalism, etc.
- Perceptions of (Hetero)sexism and Racism in the US
Goals

• Demographic Models
  – Gender → Job Satisfaction
  – Race → Job Satisfaction

• Network Models
  – Gender → Networks → Job Satisfaction
  – Race → Networks → Job Satisfaction
Qualitative Analysis

- Limited to: Health, Community & Economic Development, City Planning and Police
- Preliminary Findings on
  - Boards and Commissions
    - Largely white, male, middle to upper class
  - Overall Budget
    - Operating Budget
      - Largely spent on personnel
      - Police & Fire=66%
    - Little mention of gender/race in budget priorities
    - Some data on CincyInsights disaggregated by gender & race (but no intersectional data)