

Date: June 2, 2023
To: Board Members, Citizen Complaint Authority
From: Gabriel Davis, Director
Subject: Investigation Summary – June 6, 2023 Board Meeting

1

Complaint #	21205
Complainant	Michael Hickland
Incident Date	October 5, 2021
CCA Investigator	Jessalyn Goodman
Allegations	Excessive Force

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Hickland and Witness A had an argument at Witness A’s residence; Witness A contacted CPD. Officers Toni Nash and Carol Walker arrived at the residence. During their encounter, Officer Nash threatened to deploy her CEW against Mr. Hickland. She gave him conflicting commands; when he attempted to comply, Officer Nash deployed her CEW. Mr. Hickland believed Officer Nash used excessive force.

FINDINGS

Original Allegation

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	Toni Nash	Michael Hickland	Sustained

Recommendation:

R2315: Officer Training

CCA recommends Officer Nash participate in the necessary training to remediate tactical concerns regarding her use of conflicting commands and prevent similar scenarios in the future where CEWs are used without reasonable justification. ■

2

Complaint #	21214
Complainant	Michelle Simms
Incident Date	October 12, 2021
CCA Investigator	Morgan Givens
Allegations	Improper Stop, Improper Search, and Improper Pointing of a Firearm

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Ms. Simms alleged that on Tuesday, October 12, 2021 at approximately at 3342 Spokane Avenue, Officers Marsh and Clark improperly stopped her son, Witness A (M/B/19). Officers Marsh and Clark searched his vehicle and pointed their firearms at the vehicle which was parked outside of her residence at 3342 Spokane Avenue.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Improper Stop	Raymond Marsh	Witness A	Exonerated
2	Improper Search	Raymond Marsh	Witness A	Exonerated
3	Improper Pointing of a Firearm	Raymond Marsh	Witness A	Exonerated
4	Improper Stop	Nicholas Clark	Witness A	Exonerated
5	Improper Search	Nicholas Clark	Witness A	Exonerated
6	Improper Pointing of a Firearm	Nicholas Clark	Witness A	Exonerated

3

Complaint #	21215
Complainant	Jeremy Hahn
Incident Date	October 10, 2021
CCA Investigator	Jessalyn Goodman
Allegations	Improper Procedure and Excessive Force

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Excerpt from CPD: Officers Hunter Followell-Gibson and Miguel Dilbert were dispatched for a Domestic Violence call, where [Mr. Hahn] was detained for an investigation of domestic violence.

Mr. Hahn suffered a laceration to the top of his head during the police contact. Mr. Hahn made statements that Officer Followell-Gibson and Officer Dilbert used excessive force during his arrest, causing the injury. Cincinnati Fire responded to the scene and triaged Mr. Hahn’s minor injuries.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	Hunter Gibson	Jeremy Hahn	Unfounded
2	Excessive Force	Miguel Dilbert	Jeremy Hahn	Unfounded

Collateral Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
3	Improper Procedure	Daniel Ray	Jeremy Hahn	Sustained

■

4

Complaint #	21220
Complainant	Terrance Shannon
Incident Date	October 20, 2021
CCA Investigator	Robert Stephens
Allegations	Discourtesy, Misconduct, Improper Procedure

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Shannon stated that he was grilling food for his family when Officer Johnson approached him and called him out by his name, and told him that he was not able to grill there. The officer proceeded to kick the grill causing the food to spill onto the ground, then stated “I run this shit.”

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Discourtesy	Derrick Johnson	Terrence Shannon	Sustained

Collateral Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
2	Misconduct	Derrick Johnson	Terrence Shannon	Sustained
3	Improper Procedure (BWC)	Derrick Johnson	Terrence Shannon	Sustained



5

Complaint #	21233
Complainant	Tyler Speed
Incident Date	November 21, 2021
CCA Investigator	Morgan Givens
Allegations	Excessive Force

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Speed alleged that on Sunday, November 21, 2021 at 3:27 AM at [REDACTED], Officer Pierson “choked him and threw him against a wall” while placing him into custody.

FINDINGS

Original Allegation

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	Todd Pierson	Tyler Speed	Exonerated



6

Complaint #	21238
Complainant	Renato Stone
Incident Date	June 6, 2021
CCA Investigator	Morgan Givens
Allegations	Improper Stop, Improper Search, Harassment, and Discrimination

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Stone alleged that on Sunday, June 6, 2021 on I-75 Officers Orkies and Johnson improperly stopped and searched his vehicle. He further alleged that Officer Carpenter harassed and discriminated against him by

continuously towing his vehicle because of his race.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Improper Stop	Tyler Johnson	Renato Stone	Exonerated
2	Improper Search	Tyler Johnson	Renato Stone	Exonerated
3	Improper Stop	William Orkies	Renato Stone	Exonerated
4	Improper Search	William Orkies	Renato Stone	Exonerated
5	Harassment	Eric Carpenter	Renato Stone	Unfounded
6	Discrimination	Eric Carpenter	Renato Stone	Unfounded

■

7

Complaint #	21246
Complainant	CB (minor), JB (minor) and SB (minor)
Incident Date	November 4, 2021
CCA Investigator	Makiedah Messam
Allegations	Improper Stop, Improper Pointing of a Firearm, Improper Search

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

SB stated, “I was pulling out of Lee’s Chicken and the police pulled in front of me with his gun out and said, “we have a stolen vehicle.” Six other [police] cars pulled up with nothing but guns saying, “let us see your hands now.” They then got all of us out of the vehicle one at a time and handcuffed all of us. We were later put in their cars being detained for nearly an hour with no adult on the scene. They got in the vehicle I was driving to move out the way. The officers didn’t ask for my license, registration, or insurance.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Improper Stop	Justin Bittinger	SB	Exonerated
2	Improper Pointing of a Firearm	Justin Bittinger	SB	Exonerated
3	Improper Pointing of a Firearm	Miykael Freeman	SB	Exonerated
4	Improper Pointing of a Firearm	Kyle Strunk	SB	Exonerated
5	Improper Search	Justin Bittinger	SB	Sustained
6	Improper Search	Justin Bittinger	JB	Sustained

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
7	Improper Search	Justin Bittinger	Witness A	Sustained
8	Improper Search	Miykael Freeman	CB	Sustained

Observation:

CPD’s Internal Investigation Section’s (IIS) investigation exonerated Officer Bittinger of allegations relating to the Improper Stop, Search, and Pointing of a Firearm. It does not appear that charges were considered against any other responding officer.

Recommendation:

R2312 - Search or Entry Policy/Procedure: Frisk Policy/Procedure or Training

To ensure effective and Constitutional policing, the Cincinnati Police Department should review the frisks and searches of its officers and consider implementing additional training so as to ensure that officers who frisk or search persons before placing them into police cruisers have a specific and articulable belief, based on the reasonable person standard, that the person to be searched is armed and dangerous, and are not simply relying on the fact that they are placing a suspect into a cruiser as a lawful reason to search.

In this case, as well as several others investigated by CCA spanning recent years, officers have informed CCA that as a matter of course, practice, or procedure, they frisk suspects for weapons prior to placing them in police cruisers, regardless of whether the individual is under arrest or suspected of possessing a weapon. This belief runs contrary to Ohio law, the U.S. Constitution, and CPD policy. CPD Procedure § 12.554 states “every ‘Terry’ type stop does not automatically authorize a frisk. If a frisk is conducted, the officer must be able to articulate specific facts which led them to believe the individual could be armed and dangerous.” In addition, the Ohio Supreme Court has held that “during a routine traffic stop, it is unreasonable for an officer to search the driver for weapons before placing him or her in a patrol car, if the sole reason for placing the driver in the patrol car during the investigation is for the convenience of the officer.” *See State v. Lozada*, 92 Ohio St.3d 74, 77, 748 N.E.2d 520, 524 (2001). Additional training is needed to ensure compliance with policy and law.

■

8

Complaint #	22130
Complainant	Amanda Plunkett
Incident Date	June 27, 2022
CCA Investigator	Robert Stephens
Allegations	Excessive Force, Improper Procedure

**COMPLAINT
SUMMARY**

Amanda Plunkett expressed concern to CCA about a video she viewed online of Cincinnati Police Officers arresting a minor. She alleged that on June 27, 2022, officers used excessive force in arresting that minor at the intersection of East Seymour Avenue and Reading Road.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	William Orkies	Amanda Plunkett	Exonerated
2	Excessive Force	Zachary Kress	Amanda Plunkett	Not Sustained

Collateral Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
3	Improper Procedure	William Orkies	Amanda Plunkett	Sustained
4	Improper Procedure	Zachary Kress	Amanda Plunkett	Sustained

Recommendations:

R2316 - Juvenile Engagement and Enforcement

The Cincinnati Police Department should update its policy on juvenile enforcement to mirror IACP's Model Policy on Juvenile Diversion and Custody by (1) including an explicit policy directive that "taking juveniles into custody should be avoided whenever possible," and (2) detailing the options and alternatives that law enforcement officers have at their disposal short of detention or arrest, such as (a) "release without further action," (b) "informal counseling to caution the juvenile regarding the consequences of their actions," (c) "release to a parent, legal guardian, or responsible adult, as defined by statute of the Jurisdiction," (d) "notification of parent, legal guardian, or responsible adult," or (e) "use of diversion or extrajudicial measure programs, such as school- or community-based services.

R2317 - Juvenile Engagement and Enforcement

The Cincinnati Police Department should create juvenile-specific de-escalation policies and trainings that incorporate both a juvenile aggression control model and as well as professionally evaluated skills that law enforcement officers have used to de-escalate conflicts with juveniles.

IACP's Police Chief Magazine has released information on establishing such policies and models, including citations to reference materials, and those sources should be mined for best practices in structuring juvenile-specific de-escalation tools and practices.¹ Officers should be mindful of the fact that juveniles and adults differ in critical respects. Research indicates that juveniles are still developing both physically and mentally, and their decision-making abilities may not be fully formed. Many of our youth do not fully appreciate the consequences of their actions and the legal implications of those consequences. In addition, when police interact with angry or impulsive juveniles, and when police use "increasingly more forceful language and more aggressive behavior" when dealing with those youth, any resulting "defiant behavior . . . might indicate that the adolescent is suffering from trauma-related difficulties and that de-escalating the situation will require a more calming intervention on the officers'

part.”²² Juvenile-specific de-escalation techniques can help prevent conflicts from escalating into violence, which can further erode trust between youth and law enforcement.

R2318 - Use of Force Policy/Procedure

CCA recommends CPD revise its use of force policies to define a “choke hold” and clarify what qualifies as a “choke hold” under its Procedure Manual, including by stating what kinds of neck restraints or neck holds qualify as “choke holds,” “similar type of holds,” or are otherwise prohibited. CCA recommends that such a revision incorporate standardized language such as from the National Consensus Policy on Use of Force or another comparable source that clearly defines the kind of force or techniques that constitute a chokehold.

In CPD Procedure §12.545 Use of Force, the definition section provides the following with respect to choke holds: “The courts could consider a choke hold or other similar type of holds as deadly force. Choke holds are prohibited unless a situation arises where the use of deadly force is permissible under exhibiting law and Department policy.” However, the section does not define with specificity what a “choke hold” or “similar type of hold” would be. Neither does Procedure §12.545 say, on its face, whether other neck holds or neck restraints that CPD does not consider to be “choke holds” are permitted.

9

Complaint #	22192
Complainant	Christian Pearson
Incident Date	June 21, 2022
CCA Investigator	Ike Ekeke
Allegations	Improper Stop, Improper Search, Discourtesy, Improper Procedure

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Christian Pearson alleged that on Tuesday, June 21, 2022 at 5:30pm at 2974 Colerain Avenue, a police officer, later identified by CCA to be Officer Michael B. Smith, initiated a traffic stop. Mr. Pearson further alleged prior to the traffic stop, he and his friend (Witness A) had gone to a Shell Gas station. Mr. Pearson wore an empty holster when he went inside the store. Mr. Pearson said that “the officers” initially claimed there was a “warrant on the vehicle.” However, Mr. Pearson received temporary tags issued the previous week, and no one mentioned a warrant to him then. Mr. Pearson and Witness A were instructed to exit the vehicle and frisked upon their exit. The officers repeatedly asked Mr. Pearson for his firearm, which was located in the vehicle’s glove box. The officers searched the rest of the vehicle. Mr. Pearson was charged with Weapons Under Disability and transported to the Hamilton County Justice Center.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Improper Stop	Michael Smith	Christian Pearson	Exonerated
2	Improper Seizure	Matthew Croswell	Christian Pearson	Exonerated
3	Improper Search	Craig Copenhaver	Christian Pearson	Exonerated
4	Improper Search	Scott Cox	Christian Pearson	Exonerated
5	Improper Search	Barry Rogers	Christian Pearson	Exonerated
6	Improper Search	Jason Mellman	Christian Pearson	Exonerated
7	Improper Search	Jennifer Hoff	Christian Pearson	Exonerated
8	Improper Search	Craig Croswell	Christian Pearson	Exonerated
9	Improper Search	Merredeth Newman	Witness A	Sustained
10	Discourtesy	Barry Rogers	Christian Pearson	Unfounded
11	Discourtesy	Michael Smith	Christian Pearson	Sustained
12	Discourtesy	John Wolff	Christian Pearson	Unfounded
13	Discourtesy	Matthew Croswell	Christian Pearson	Unfounded

Collateral Allegation

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
14	Improper Procedure (BWC)	Barry Rogers	Christian Pearson	Sustained

10

Complaint #	22220
Complainant	Antonasia Brumfield (Joshua Poff)
Incident Date	September 18, 2022
CCA Investigator	Joseph Vesper
Allegations	Improper Stop, Improper Seizure, Improper Search

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Ms. Brumfield alleged that on Sunday, September 18, 2022 at 1:00 PM at 1800 Sunset Ave, police officers later identified by CCA to be Officers Buttinger and Dews, stopped Mr. Poff and Ms. Brumfield in their vehicle for no reason, after Mr. Poff failed to stop on red and followed them for three miles. From there Officer Bittinger was very “provocative” towards Mr. Poff and didn’t run his info before arresting him. The Officer’s believed Mr. Poff was acting too hostile and asked Mr. Poff to step out of the vehicle, which angered Mr. Poff to where he said he wasn't getting out, but he then got out of the vehicle. As soon as he exited, they handcuffed him and searched the vehicle for no reason, claiming they smelled marijuana.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Improper Stop	Justin Bittinger	Joshua Poff	Exonerated
2	Improper Stop	Robert Dews	Joshua Poff	Exonerated
3	Improper Seizure	Justin Bittinger	Joshua Poff	Exonerated
4	Improper Seizure	Robert Dews	Joshua Poff	Exonerated
5	Improper Search	Justin Bittinger	Joshua Poff	Exonerated

Collateral Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
6	Improper Procedure	Justin Bittinger	Joshua Poff	Sustained
7	Improper Procedure	Robert Dews	Joshua Poff	Sustained

11

Complaint #	22223
Complainant	Wendy Carswell
Incident Date	May 15, 2022
CCA Investigator	Makiedah Messam
Allegations	Excessive Force, Improper Procedure and Discourtesy

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Ms. Carswell alleged that on Sunday, May 15, 2022 at approximately 7 p.m. at TQL Stadium, “it was the beginning of the WHO concert, and I was coming out of the restroom and two police officers and a TQL guard told me I had to leave because I stepped out of the arena. I told them to f*** off. I went to another entrance, and they followed me and when I tried to walk in, they said I was being belligerent. They handcuffed me behind my back and refused to talk to me. I am 57 years old I have COPD and all I had was my pack of cigarettes, I was not a threat. I couldn't breathe and I kept asking to change the cuffs to front. One of the officers said since I was talking, I could breathe. They had me sitting on the TQL steps for half an hour, still cuffed in back and seven officers were in a semi-circle around me, none of whom would talk to me. They finally decided to charge me with criminal trespass, got a ticket and court date. The fact is they had no "bed side manner[s]" at all and these officers need to be held accountable like anyone else doing a job. They need to be reprimanded, retrained or fired.”

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	Kaneshia Howell	Wendy Carswell	Exonerated
2	Excessive Force	Kraig Kunz	Wendy Carswell	Exonerated
3	Excessive Force	Nikolas Bicknell	Wendy Carswell	Exonerated
4	Excessive Force	Kyle Bishop	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
5	Excessive Force	Charles Siegel	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
6	Discourtesy	Kaneshia Howell	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
7	Discourtesy	Kraig Kunz	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
8	Discourtesy	Nikolas Bicknell	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
9	Discourtesy	Kyle Bishop	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
10	Discourtesy	Charles Siegel	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
11	Discourtesy	Brian Kneller	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
12	Discourtesy	Terry Jacobs	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded
13	Discourtesy	Terrance Dobbins	Wendy Carswell	Unfounded

Collateral Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
14	Improper Procedure (BWC)	Kraig Kunz	Wendy Carswell	Sustained

■

12

Complaint #	22224
Complainant	Doug Spencer
Incident Date	September 27, 2022
CCA Investigator	Robert Stephens
Allegation	Improper Stop

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Spencer alleged that on Tuesday, September 27, 2022 at 1:59 PM at [REDACTED] police officers later identified by CCA to be Officers Howard and Fehrman improperly stopped him right after picking up his two ride share passengers. Mr. Spencer believed the stop was illegal. He could not remember if he used a turn signal pulling out of the parking lot or not but regardless, he does not think that is a violation to not use it. He also believed that this was just an excuse to pull him over. After speaking with the officers, they also explained that they were looking for a wanted person.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Improper Stop	Taylor Howard	Doug Spencer	Exonerated
2	Improper Stop	Cameron Fehrman	Doug Spencer	Exonerated

13

Complaint #	22236
Complainant	Anonymous
Incident Date	October 9, 2022
CCA Investigator	Makiedah Messam
Allegations	Excessive Force

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

The complainant alleged that on Sunday, October 9, 2022 at 11 p.m. at [REDACTED], CPD officers, later identified by CCA, arrived at her residence to investigate an alleged burglary. Two residents were inside the apartment and attempted to show mail as proof that they lived at the location. One of the residents, who has anxiety issues, and a learning disability was threatened to exit the residence. When she eventually exited the residence, she was slammed to the ground after an officer slapped a phone out of her hand.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	Richard Christoph	Anonymous	Unfounded
2	Excessive Force	Sydney Morehead	Anonymous	Unfounded
3	Excessive Force	Christian Schapker	Anonymous	Unfounded
4	Excessive Force	Cameron Mullis	Anonymous	Unfounded
5	Excessive Force	Ryan Roberts	Anonymous	Unfounded

14

Complaint #	22241
Complainant	Edward Beverly
Incident Date	October 15, 2022
CCA Investigator	Makiedah Messam
Allegations	Excessive Force

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Edward Beverly alleged that on Saturday, October 15, 2022 along Hollensshade Avenue, “I cut my car off, went to sleep, and woke up on the floor to your officers beating my ass cause I was asleep in my car.”. CCA’s investigation revealed that Officer Steven Rogers was dispatched to Hollensshade Avenue to investigate a report of a vehicle parked in the middle of the intersection for over an hour. On his arrival, Officer Rogers found Mr. Beverly asleep in his vehicle and attempted to wake him. After Mr. Beverly exited his vehicle, Officer Rogers noticed a weapon in his waist and attempted to detain Mr. Beverly to conduct a search. A struggle ensued which resulted in both men on the ground wrestling. Other officers were dispatched to aid Officer Rogers. Mr. Beverly was subsequently handcuffed and searched with the assistance of Officers Robert Johnson, #P0631, M/B/55, William Nastold, #P0474, M/W/38 and Jeremy Burroughs, #P0573, M/W/44

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	Steven Rogers	Edward Beverly	Exonerated
2	Excessive Force	Robert Johnson	Edward Beverly	Unfounded
3	Excessive Force	William Nastold	Edward Beverly	Unfounded
4	Excessive Force	Jeremy Burroughs	Edward Beverly	Unfounded

■

15

Complaint #	22249
Complainant	Dawon Harris & Onana Settles
Incident Date	October 30, 2022
CCA Investigator	Joseph Vesper
Allegations	Improper Stop, Excessive Force, and Improper Procedure

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Via Complaint Form Submitted to CPD by Complainants: "Officer Richmond and unknown Officers violated Dawson Harris's 4th amendment by illegally detaining him. Officer Richmond ended up getting physical and choked Ms. Settles while no other Officer stepped in. No arrests were made."

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Improper Stop	Aaron Perkins	Dawon Harris	Exonerated
2	Improper Stop	Alexander Richmond	Dawon Harris	Exonerated
3	Excessive Force	Alexander Richmond	Onan Settles	Sustained

Collateral Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
4	Improper Procedure	Aaron Perkins	Onan Settles	Sustained
5	Improper Procedure	Alexander Richmond	Onan Settles	Sustained
6	Improper Procedure	Estella Spaulding	Onan Settles	Sustained

■

16

Complaint #	22265
Complainant	Keylon Cousins
Incident Date	December 1, 2022
CCA Investigator	Joseph Vesper
Allegations	Improper Stop

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Ms. Cousins alleged that on Thursday, December 1, 2022 at the corner of West 8th St. and Overlook Ave. Cincinnati, OH 45238, a police officer later identified by CCA to be Officer Wuest, around 12:40 AM, stopped Ms. Cousins at the corner of West 8th and Overlook Ave, on their way to work. The officer said that there was a capias on the vehicle. Ms. Cousins did not believe that there was a capias on the vehicle and the officer was merely looking for another family member. The officer didn't cite her any traffic violation or give a reason for the stop. Ms. Cousins believes that the stop was improper.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Improper Stop	Daniel Wuest	Keylon Cousins	Exonerated

17

Complaint #	22271
Complainant	Karyn Ranz
Incident Date	September 7, 2022
CCA Investigator	Makiedah Messam
Allegations	Improper Stop, Improper Procedure and Excessive Force

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr., Ranz stated, "I witnessed nine police officers surrounding a boy. Two officers had their hands on the child. One officer had the child's arm in an awkward position and pushing the child's arm up. The child was standing on his toes because of the hold. A second officer had his hands on both sides of the child's elbow pushing down. The child was crying out while the officers did this to him. The other seven officers created a human wall to prevent people from seeing. I was told multiple times to leave by Officer Brown, but I respectfully declined. I was asked repeatedly for my name, but I respectfully declined to answer. I told Officer Brown that I would stay until I knew the boy was safe. An officer pointed his phone at me (I assume to take a video or picture). A few minutes later

Officer Brown approached me, called me by my name, and asked me how long I had worked at Metro. I felt threatened for standing on the sidewalk. The child was taken inside the small Metro station and his hands were zip-tied behind his back. The officer emptied the child's pockets. I witnessed many people jaywalking while this was happening, but only the CPS boy was restrained, searched, and detained. I stayed until the child left on his bus.”

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	Albert Brown	Unknown Male	Unfounded
2	Excessive Force	Darris Sneed	Unknown Male	Exonerated
3	Excessive Force	Keith Spurling	Unknown Male	Exonerated
4	Excessive Force	Charles Bell	Unknown Male	Exonerated
5	Improper Search	Albert Brown	Unknown Female (minor)	Unfounded
6	Improper Search	Darris Sneed	Unknown Female (minor)	Unfounded
7	Improper Search	Derrick Edwards	Unknown Female (minor)	Unfounded
8	Improper Search	Charles Bell	Unknown Female (minor)	Unfounded
9	Improper Stop	Howard Grant	Karen Ranz	Exonerated

Collateral Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
10	Improper Procedure (Contact Card)	Howard Grant	Karen Ranz	Sustained

18

Complaint #	22272
Complainant	Barbara Young
Incident Date	December 7, 2022
CCA Investigator	Makiedah Messam
Allegations	Discrimination and Discourtesy

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

On Wednesday, December 7, 2022, at 4:30 p.m. at an apartment in Western Hills, police officers later identified by CCA to be Officers Kelsey and Agbleke responded to a request for a welfare check in Western Hills. Ms. Barbara Young alleged officers arrived at her apartment and when she opened the door, Officer Agbleke stood in the hallway and addressed her in a rude tone, started asking her questions about her medical diagnosis and what medications she was taking. Ms. Young stated that she believed the officer spoke to her in a condescending manner and was disrespectful of her privacy and that the officer was prejudiced against her due to her mental health and physical disability.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Discrimination	Savon C. Kelsey	Barbara Young	Unfounded
2	Discrimination	Koffi P. Ableke	Barbara Young	Unfounded
3	Discourtesy	Savon C. Kelsey	Barbara Young	Unfounded
4	Discourtesy	Koffi P. Agbleke	Barbara Young	Unfounded

19

Complaint #	22280
Complainant	Nasir Peterson
Incident Date	December 14, 2022
CCA Investigator	Joseph Vesper
Allegations	Discrimination and Lack of Service

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Peterson alleged that on Wednesday, December 14, 2022 at 500 Vine St. Cincinnati, OH 45202, Officer Hayes, responded to an auto accident after Witness A, allegedly ran a red light and damaged Mr. Peterson's vehicle. Mr. Peterson alleged Officer Hayes did very little to resolve or help. Key information was not put in the auto collision report. Officer Hayes did not seem to care or want to investigate at all. Mr. Peterson felt like Officer Hayes took sides and is left to wonder if there would have been a different outcome if he was a different color.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Discrimination	David Hayes	Nasir Peterson	Unfounded
2	Lack of Service	David Hayes	Nasir Peterson	Unfounded

20

Complaint #	22283
Complainant	Unknown
Incident Date	Unknown
CCA Investigator	Joseph Vesper
Allegations	Discrimination

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

An unknown complainant alleged that on an unknown date and time at District 3, 2300 Ferguson Rd., Cincinnati, Ohio, per e-mail, Sergeant Hicks’s “childhood friends have live warrants and are out free. They have warrants ordered back in October. They have been in contact with the police several times since having a warrant. No arrest has been made. She is white. If she were black like other members of our community, she would have been arrested the day of the warrant. It is blatant racial disparities of the legal system, and it starts with Sgt Jacob Hicks.”

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Discrimination	Jacob Hicks	Unknown	Unfounded

21

Complaint #	23003
Complainant	Vidal Middlebrooks
Incident Date	December 26, 2022
CCA Investigator	Jessalyn Goodman
Allegation	Excessive Force

COMPLAINT SUMMARY

Mr. Middlebrooks alleged that on Monday, December 26, 2022 at 1:40pm at [REDACTED], Officer Harris assaulted him by aggressively shoving him out of the elevator, which caused pain from a previous back injury.

FINDINGS

Original Allegations

No.	Allegation	Subject Officer	Involved Citizen	Finding
1	Excessive Force	Karoline Harris	Vidal Middlebrooks	Unfounded

■