

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

DATE: OCTOBER 9, 2014

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, October 9, 2014. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, Mr. Robert Braddock, Vice-Chair, and Mr. C. Freeman McNeal. Commission staff present included Ms. Georgetta Kelly, Human Resources Director, Ms. Nancy Olind, Assistant Human Resources Director, and Ms. Seeta Martindale, Recording Secretary.

AGENDA ITEMS

APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 9/25/2014 MEETING. Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner Braddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner McNeal seconded the motion, and the minutes were unanimously approved.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:

Anne Barbieri to the position of Customer Relations Representative in the Planning and Buildings Department. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Barbieri meets the minimum requirements for the position, completed the exam process, meets the needs of the department, and was selected from among the passing candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

Bryan Simonson and Ron Hatfield to the position of Welder Helper in the Water Works Department. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Simonson and Mr. Hatfield meet the minimum requirements for the position, completed the exam process, meet the needs of the department, and were selected from among the passing candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

Cecily Laycock, Natasha Kendricks, Heather Sabin and Sweeti Ranjit to position of Casework Associate in the Health Department. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as the identified candidates meet the minimum requirements for the position, completed the exam process, meet the needs of the department, and were selected from among the passing candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

Gerard Mennona to the position of Utility Technician in the Department of Sewers. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Mennona meets the minimum requirements for the position, completed the exam process, meets the needs of the department, and was selected from among the passing candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

Jimmy Brunner and Michael Sizemore to the position of Service Crew Leader in the Parks Department. This position was posted as a promotional examination. Mr. Brunner and Mr. Sizemore meet the minimum requirements, received passing scores and were selected, within the collective bargaining guidelines, from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

OCTOBER 9, 2014

MINUTES cont'd...

Robert Ferrell, James Goss, Christopher Nichols, and Ellis Ramsey to full-time Sanitation Helpers in the Public Services Department. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Ferrell, Mr. Goss, Mr. Nichols, and Mr. Ramsey meet the minimum qualifications based upon their seniority within City service, and were selected for the position of Sanitation Helper within the collective bargaining guidelines. This item was noted by the Commission.

Tashae Watkins to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Parks Department. This position was posted as a promotional examination. Ms. Watkins meets the minimum requirements, received a passing score on the exam, and was selected within the collective bargaining guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive

Sara Bewsey to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work; rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Bewsey meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

Joey Hoskins to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work; rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Hoskins meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

Joann Cox to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item, as Ms. Cox meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

Brooke Whalen to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Whalen meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

Teresa Best to the position of Expanded Function Dental Assistant in the Health Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work; rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Best meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

OCTOBER 9, 2014

MINUTES cont'd...

Caylyn Maertz to the position of Dental Hygienist in the Health Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item, as Ms. Maertz meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

Lisa Bambach to the position of Graphic Designer in the Department of Transportation and Engineering. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work; rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Bambach meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

Chris Kelly to the position of Supervising Engineer in the Department of Transportation and Engineering. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work; rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Kelly meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

Pete McKee to the position of Engineer Intern in the Department of Sewers. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional and specific nature of the work; rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. McKee meets the minimum qualifications and the needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

PROMOTION: Personnel Action

Bobbye Wood to the position of Inspector 2 (PMCE) in the Department of Trade and Development. Mr. Wood successfully passed the Inspector 2 (PMCE) promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Brandi Sanders to the position of Service Area Coordinator (Recreation Programming) in the Recreation Department. Ms. Sanders successfully passed the Service Area Coordinator (Recreation Programming) promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Brian Sears to the position of Maintenance Machinist in the Water Works Department. Mr. Sears successfully passed the Maintenance Machinist promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

OCTOBER 9, 2014

MINUTES cont'd...

Brodie Getz to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Recreation Department. Ms. Getz successfully passed the Administrative Specialist promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

David Scott Ryan to the position of Inspector 2 (PMCE) in the Department of Trade and Development. Mr. Ryan successfully passed the Inspector 2 (PMCE) promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Donan Nixon to the position of Waste Water Collections Equipment Specialist in the Department of Sewers. Mr. Nixon successfully passed the Waste Water Collections Equipment Specialist promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

James Brunner to the position of Inspector 2 (PMCE) in the Department of Trade and Development. Mr. Brunner successfully passed the Inspector 2 (PMCE) promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Jason Rutschilling to the position of Civil Engineering Technician 2 (Survey) in the Department of Sewers. Mr. Rutschilling successfully passed the Civil Engineering Technician 2 (Survey) promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

John Losenkamp to the position of Supervising Storekeeper in the Department of Sewers. Mr. Losenkamp successfully passed the Supervising Storekeeper promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Justin Barkey to the position of Maintenance Machinist in the Water Works Department. Mr. Barkey successfully passed the Maintenance Machinist promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Kenith Luttrell to the position of Maintenance Machinist in the Water Works Department. Mr. Luttrell successfully passed the Maintenance Machinist promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Kevin Sluder to the position of Maintenance Machinist in the Water Works Department. Mr. Sluder successfully passed the Maintenance Machinist promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

OCTOBER 9, 2014

MINUTES cont'd...

Kevin Wolf, Seth Plaut, and Brian Haysbert to the position of Engineering Technician 3 (Traffic Services Bureau/Controller Shop) in the Public Services Department. Mr. Wolf, Mr. Plaut, and Mr. Haysbert successfully passed the Civil Engineering Technician 3 (Traffic Services Bureau/Controller Shop) promotional exam, meet the minimum requirements for the position, and were selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Kimberly Smith to the position of Service Area Coordinator (Recreation Programming) in the Recreation Department. Ms. Smith successfully passed the Service Area Coordinator (Recreation Programming) promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Michail Weimer to the position of Buildings and Grounds Maintenance Crew Leader in the Water Works Department. Mr. Weimer successfully passed the Buildings and Grounds Maintenance Crew Leader promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

PROMOTION: Personnel Action (Working out of Class)

Venyke Payton to the position of Administrative Specialist (Communications) in the Public Services Department. Ms. Payton was selected for temporary promotion to work out of class in the position of Administrative Specialist (Communications) from 4/13/14 to 6/22/14. This item was noted by the Commission.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Personnel Action (Working Out of Class Extension)

Request from the Water Works Department to extend "Working Out of Class" status for Richard Creager as a Supervisor of Maintenance. Mr. Creager was temporarily assigned to work out of class in the position of Supervisor of Maintenance in order to provide continuity of the department's operations until the eligible list was released. Since interdepartmental interviews have been scheduled for the week of October 13, 2014, the extension of Mr. Creager's status for working out of class is beneficial to the department in order to provide a smoother transition and continuity in service until the position is permanently filled. This item was noted by the Commission.

PROMOTION: Temporary Promotion

Lisa Knapp to the position of Emergency Communications Manager in the City Manager Office/Emergency Communications Center. In accordance with the City Manager's directive, the specialized nature of this position, and the critical operational needs of the Emergency Communications Center, Ms. Knapp has been temporarily assigned to fill the immediate needs of the department; pending the permanent filling of the position. Notwithstanding the educational requirement, Ms. Knapp was offered the assignment based on her immediate availability based upon her current role as Assistant Manager of the Emergency Communication Manager. The Commission approved the request, in this instance, in order to provide continuity in this critical service area for the citizens of the City of Cincinnati until the position is permanently filled.

OCTOBER 9, 2014

MINUTES cont'd...

Larry Whitaker to the position of Supervising Management Analyst in the Public Services Department. Based upon the approved staffing recommendations from the appointing authority, following the recommendations of a climate assessment of the Public Services Department, Mr. Whitaker was temporarily promoted to the position of Supervising Management Analyst due to the critical operational needs of the department. Notwithstanding an oversight by the Human Resources Department to provide more timely notice of the start/expiration dates of Mr. Whitaker's temporary assignment to the Commission, and the current review of permanent applicants, the Commission, upon evaluation of the matter, suspended the requirement to rotate the position, in this instance, in order to maintain continuity in service to the public.

PROMOTION: Without Exam

Angela Winkfield to the position of Accountant in the Police Department. The position was posted within the department in an effort to determine the level of interest and eligibility for the position. Ms. Winkfield was selected for the position as she meets the minimum requirements, fulfills the needs of the department, and was the only interested and qualified candidate in the employing unit. This item was approved by the Commission.

TRANSFER: Personnel Action

Tom Seward to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist in the Water Works Department.

Mr. Seward meets the minimum requirements for the position, fulfills the needs of the department and was selected for transfer within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

ELIGIBLE LIST: Request for Approval

- a) Traffic Aids Worker (Article XX) – Promotional exam

This item was tabled until 10/23/2014.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Special Examiners

- a) **Fire Apparatus Operator:**
 - Amos Johnson – City of Woodlawn, OH
 - Marty Kroell – City of Norwood, OH
 - Chuck Dietz – City of Newport, KY
 - Leonard Brooks – City of Forest Park, OH
 - Jason Geiser – Colerain Township, OH

The staff provided related information and recommended approval of the special examiners. This item was approved by the Commission.

CLASSIFICATION: Request for approval of new and/or revised classification specifications:

- a) Senior Buyer
- b) Information Technology Assistant Manager (Information Security Officer)

The staff recommended approval of the new/revised classification specifications. These (2) classification specifications were approved by the Commission.

CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization:

- a) **Public Services Department:** Add: (1) Senior Administrative Specialist to Division of Facilities Management. Delete: (1) Senior Administrative Specialist from Division of Neighborhood Operations
- b) **Parks Department:** Add (1) Administrative Specialist
- c) **Water Works Department:** Add (4) Co-op Student Intern 4 and delete (2) Co-op Student Intern 2
- d) **Department of Sewers:** Add (1) Accounting Technician 2 and delete (1) Administrative Technician

The staff supported its recommendation for approval of the add/delete positions with budget and organizational information relating to each item and the items were approved.

APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items:

- a) **Appeal Hearing Schedule:**

Name	Scheduled for:
Veronica Barnes	Appellant withdrew Appeal Hearing Request
Robert DeBonis	Scheduling Suspended/Appellant awaiting delivery of Public Records Material
Anthony Axle	Closed/Written Commission Decision to follow
Vinson Key	Continuance requested by Appellant on May 30, 2014/Contacted by Staff regarding re-scheduling
Jeff Stallworth	Staff contacted Appellant in the attempt to re-schedule Hearing date
Daryl Ross	On Hold/Law Dept. providing updates

The staff provided information on the current Appeal Hearing Schedule. The Commission noted this item.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request to Speak Before Commission

Request from Jude Johnson to speak before the Commission regarding application and clarification of Civil Service Rule 10, Section 10. Mr. Johnson was present at the meeting to speak on the matter of the application of Civil Service Rule 10 § 10 in relation to the temporary promotion for the Supervising Management Analyst position in the Public Services Department. Notwithstanding that the changes in organization and duties were directed by the then Interim City Manager, Mr. Johnson charged that the Civil Service Rules governing bringing such personnel actions before the Commission were not upheld. The Commission took Mr. Johnson's comments under advisement and noted his concerns. The Commissioners were concerned related to the delay in the submission of items in a timely manner by the Human Resources Department. As a result, the Human Resources Department will complete an audit to review the submission of items from the preceding six months and update the Commission to ensure no additional oversights occurred as a result of staff transitioning over the previous months.

OCTOBER 9, 2014

MINUTES cont'd...

Request from the Board of Education to re-administer the Level 1A Building Engineer examination. Present at the table was Ms. Margaret Key, Senior Human Resources Analyst/Consultant for the Board of Education, Mr. Adrian Brown, Chief Steward/Executive Auditor for the IUOE 20, and Mr. Steve Turner. The staff recommended that the Level 1A Building Engineer exam administered on August 18, 2014, be revoked and a new examination be administered. The Commission noted the request to re-administer the exam, contingent upon administering a Job Analysis Questionnaire. This item remains under consideration.

Request from Adrian Brown to speak before the Commission regarding the Board of Education's Level 1A Building Engineer examination. Present at the table was Mr. Adrian Brown, Chief Steward/Executive Auditor for the IUOE 20, along with Mr. Steve Turner, and Ms. Margaret Key, Senior Human Resources Analyst/Consultant for the Board of Education. Mr. Brown spoke on behalf of both the Union and the candidates who took the Level 1A Building Engineer examination administered by the Board of Education on August 18, 2014. His comment was to suggest that the eligible list be released and to appoint candidates from this list prior to the changes proposed for a new test. The Commission heard his comments and noted his concerns.

APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM:

Request from Nancy Shaw to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Traffic Aids Worker. Miss Shaw was present for the meeting, voiced her concerns, requested and was granted a continuance in order to gather additional documentation. Her item will be heard again at the next Commission Meeting on October 23, 2014.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION: Request from the CODE Union

The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organized and Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the Agenda per Civil Service Rule 2 § 5. CODE was not present at the meeting. All items were waived.