PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

Monday, October 11, 2004

3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Bloomfield, Kirk, Kreider, Raser, Senhauser, and Spraul-Schmidt present. Absent: Chatterjee and Wallace

MINUTES

The minutes of the Monday, September 27, 2004 meeting were unanimously approved as corrected (Motion by Raser, second by Kirk).

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1345 MAIN STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE, HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff member Ms. Adrienne Cowden presented a proposal for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build two rooftop terraces and an addition to the Italianate structure at 1345 Main Street in the Over-the-Rhine Historic District

The changes resulting from both terraces construction includes: removal of two shed roofs and a rear window; brick masonry walls lowered and capped with a metal coping; new glazed doors with vinyl siding; a metal fence and gate on the south elevation to access the existing fire escape. Ms. Cowden explained that neither terraces would be visible on Main Street; but the terrace on the northwest corner of the building would be partially visible from Clay Street.

The proposed addition includes raising the roofline to a fourth story, remaining a shed with a shallower rake at the rear section of 1345 Main Street; three new one on-one window sash that will line up with existing windows, and new exterior brick walls to match the existing walls. The addition would not substantially change the building's form, shape, or massing.

Ms. Cowden stated that the proposed addition and terraces meets the district guidelines; and will provide additional living space for the owners and will help ensure the continued viability of the building.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger, second Kirk, Raser abstained) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness finding the addition and the proposed terraces as shown in the attached drawings, meet the Over-the-Rhine Historic District Guidelines and approve the proposal with the condition that final construction drawings be submitted to the Urban Conservator for approval prior to construction

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENES, FOR 3616 EASTERN AVENUE, COLUMBIA TUSCULUM HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff member, Ms. Adrienne Cowden presented a staff report on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of a front porch at 3616 Eastern Avenue, in the Columbia Tusculum Historic District. Ms. Cowden stated that the additional items, installation of new vinyl siding and the removal of the eaves and rafter tails were not included in the application to be considered by the Board

Ms. Cowden stated that the Historic Conservation Office (HCO) sent a Building Inspector to investigate complaints concerning demolition and construction initiated by the owner at 3616 Eastern Avenue. The Inspector ordered Mr. Beck to stop all work, and to obtain a building permit and COA.

Ms. Cowden stated that Mr. Beck obtained a building permit on September 13, 2004 for repair work to replace the porch and main roof; staff was not aware of the removal of the rafter tail and eaves before the approval of the application. September 29, 2004, the owner applied for a COA to demolish the porch roof and part of the stone piers. Ms. Cowden acknowledged that she has not received an application for the siding or the additional roofing work.

Owners and residents of Eastern Avenue attended the pre-hearing conference to voice their concerns over the work done and sent letters to staff. Ms. Cassandra Brown owner of property on Stanley Ave called staff and stated that the work looked presentable.

Ms. Cowden stated that the owner was not present, but sent photographs and a letter to justify his actions. Ms. Cowden felt that the photographs showed the siding was in fair condition and the new vinyl siding has resulted in further damage to the original woodwork. The applicant specified he did not have the funds at this time to rebuild the porch or to replace it with a new structure, nor offered remediation.

Ms. Sullebarger suggested that staff recommend the applicant to submit an application for a HIPP Loan and that the opposed letters from the residents in the neighborhood justified the staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion Kreider, second Sullebarger) to take the following action:

1. Deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the main (west) façade porch with the provision that the applicant may return to the Board with a proposal for an appropriate replacement and/or historical documentation demonstrating that removal of the porch was justified.
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the aluminum siding.
3. Deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the eaves and rafter tails and the installation of vinyl siding finding that this work does not meet the Columbia Tusculum Historic District Conservation Guidelines.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND ZONING VARIANCES, 109 MULBERRY STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC

Staff member, Ms. Caroline Kellam presented an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness and Zoning Variances to rehabilitate the building into an owner occupied two-family resident at 109 Mulberry Street in the Over-the-Rhine Historic District. The proposal included a removal of an existing dormer and construction of a new roof addition featuring a new dormer.

Ms. Kellam explained that after the staff report was completed, the applicant submitted a revised drawing of a new roof with three new windows, and a new larger dormer; staff recommended the revision as the final proposal.

She stated that the property located in a RM-07 Residential Mixed Zoning and Hillside Overlay District, required zoning variances.

Ms. Kellam stated that the new roof addition with the new dormer is compatible with surrounding neighboring properties and the project meets the guidelines for the historic district and finds that it is in the interest of historic conservation to grant the zoning variance.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion Kreider, second Spraul-Schmidt, with amendment) to take the following action:

1. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of 109 Mulberry Street and the roof addition as suggested:
2. Approve a zoning variance for the roof addition to exceed the maximum building envelope as per Chapter 1433-19(a) Base Development Requirements finding that such relief from the literal implication of the Zoning Code will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety, and welfare or injurious to property in the district or vicinity where the property is located and is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as not to adversely affect the historic architectural or aesthetic integrity of the district.
3. Final plans to be review and approved by the Urban Conservator prior to issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit.

ADJOURNMENT

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

_____ _____

William L. Forwood
Urban Conservator

John C. Senhauser, Chairman

Date: _____