

SUBJECT: A report and recommendation on a proposed zone change at 4721 Reading Road from RM-2.0 Multi-family to a PD Planned Development in the neighborhood of Bond Hill.

GENERAL INFORMATION:

Petitioner: Steven Karoly
GBBN Architects
332 E. 8th Street
Cincinnati, OH. 45202

Request: A change of zoning at 4721 Reading Road from RM-2.0 Multi-family to a PD Planned Development District.

Adjacent Land Use and Zoning:

South: MG - Manufacturing General
CG-A Commercial General-Auto

East: SF – 2 Single-Family Residential – 2,000 sf lots

North: SF – 4 Single-Family Residential – 4,000 sf lots
RM 1.2 Multi-family – 1,200 sf dwelling unit

West: SF – 4 Single-Family Residential – 4,000 sf lots
MG - Manufacturing General

Staff Conference: The Planning Division staff held a public conference on the initial zone change request from RM – 2.0 to CC-M on January 29, 2007. The petitioner, representatives of St. Aloysius, and several neighboring property owners attended. The main concern expressed by the neighbors was the fear of increased traffic because of the new development. There were several property owners in opposition to the proposed zone change.

Since January of 2007, St. Aloysius has changed their zone change request from RM-2.0 Multi-family to a PD Planned Development District. On August 2, 2007, St. Aloysius held their own public meeting regarding their new zone change request at their facility in Bond Hill in the evening. The City of Cincinnati provided the 400' radius mailing list to St. Aloysius for notification of the meeting, however City staff did not facilitate the meeting. Between January and August, St. Aloysius hired traffic consultants to complete a traffic study to evaluate the impact of the development on the street grid system. The report was presented at the August 2nd meeting. In general, the public in attendance still had concerns regarding the impacts of the potential increased traffic.

On September 19, 2007, a second zoning staff conference was held by City staff. Staff provided notice to the property owners located within a 400' radius of the St. Aloysius property as well as others persons who attended the previous public meetings. Again the petitioner, representatives of St. Aloysius and the traffic consultants were present to answer questions regarding the development and the traffic study. New information was presented regarding additional traffic analyses completed since August. Most property owners were still concerned about the property being developed and the potential increased traffic.

On Thursday evening October 25, 2007, the Cincinnati Planning Commission (CPC) held a special meeting at the Bond Hill Recreation Center to address the zone change application for 4721 Reading Road. After extensive discussion and testimony the Commission tabled the item for one month to allow St. Aloysius and the neighbors to discuss additional alternatives. Since October 25th, the Executive Director of St. Aloysius attended another Bond Hill Community Council meeting. Nothing was resolved and the meeting attendees asked St. Aloysius to leave the community. The president of the Bond Hill Community Council, Nate Johnson, offered to set up a meeting with St. Aloysius and the neighbors, although a meeting date has not yet been confirmed. St. Aloysius has made a good faith effort to comply with the Planning Commissions' request to meet with the neighborhood. Unfortunately there has been no resolution. Therefore, St. Aloysius is requesting that their zone change request move forward as presented at the October 25, 2007 CPC meeting.

BACKGROUND:

Existing Use: Currently the property at 4721 Reading Road is in use as a school with social service offices related to the school. The property is situated immediately adjacent to the Norwood Lateral (SR562) to the south and manufacturing and commercial uses along the Lateral to the east. Residential uses border the property to the northeast and north.

Current Zoning – RM - 2.0 Multi-family: The current zoning is a multi-family residential district, which permits high-density development. With 16 acres of land, the site could be developed by-right with 348 residential units and the required 696 parking spaces.

St. Aloysius is an educational and social service institution. They have been at this location since 1861 and at one time they owned 88 acres of land. They have since sold off all but 16 acres. This institution would like to remain on their historic campus and they are not interested in doing residential development. However, St. Aloysius is a non-profit entity and funds have diminished over the years. It is crucial that they take advantage of the land they own and use the property to generate additional income to keep the institution in continuous operation. Their goal is to create a social service campus with office uses that relate to the mission of their institution.

Proposed Use: The existing school and chapel will remain. The remaining property will be subdivided into 6 parcels. The following uses will occupy the six parcels:

1. The front parcel along Reading Road (Parcel 4) will have the existing school/chapel, a new school and two parking lots accommodating 200 cars.

2. The parcel at the corner of Reading Road and Joseph Avenue (Parcel 6) will be occupied by a 2-story Medical Office building (15,000 sf).
3. The parcel containing the existing group homes (Parcel 5) will retain the group homes and add parking spaces.
4. The parcel west of the school (Parcel 3) will be developed with a 2-story office building (10,000 sf) and 35 parking spaces.
5. Parcel 2 to the west will be developed with an office building (15,000 sf) and 119 parking spaces.
6. Parcel 1 to the west will be developed with a 3-story office building (20,000 sf) and 120 parking spaces.

See the attached Site Development Plan.

BASIC REQUIREMENTS OF A PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT:

According to Section 1429-05 of the Cincinnati Zoning Code, a PD District and the development within a PD District must comply with the following:

- (a) *Minimum Area* – The minimum area of a PD must be two contiguous acres. However, Council may approve a PD District that contains less than the minimum acreage required for an area on affirmative recommendation of the CPC that special site characteristics exist and the proposed land use justifies the development of the property as a PD.

The property at 4721 Reading Road is 16.75 acres.

- (b) *Ownership* – Evidence that the applicant has sufficient control over the tract of land to affect the proposed plan, including a list of all ownership and beneficial interests in the tract of land and the proposed development.

The St. Aloysius Orphan Society of Cincinnati currently owns the property and is the developer.

- (c) *Multiple buildings on a lot* – more than one building is allowed on a lot.

Currently there are three buildings on this site and once the development is complete there could potentially be eight buildings on the site.

- (d) *Historic Landmarks and Districts* –

Currently the site is neither in a historic district nor is it designated an individual landmark, although the existing structure is eligible for the National Register of Historic Places.

- (e) *Hillside Overlay Districts* –

The site is not located in a Hillside Overlay District.

- (f) *Urban Design Overlay District* –

The site is not located within an Urban Design Overlay District.

CONCEPT PLAN AND DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM STATEMENT:

According to Section 1429-09 of the Cincinnati Zoning Code, a petition to rezone a property to PD must include a concept plan and development program statement. The purpose is to describe the proposed use or uses to be conducted in the PD District. The concept plan must include text or diagrams that specify:

- (a) *Plan Elements* – the applicant has submitted a survey of the site, including a metes and bounds description and has included sufficient information regarding the proposed land uses. A site plan has been submitted showing proposed new development, parking areas, streets and driveways, and landscaping and buffer zones (see attached site plan).
- (b) *Ownership* – the applicant owns the property at 4721 Reading Road that is the subject of the proposed zone change.
- (c) *Schedule* – A construction schedule has not yet been determined and will be contingent on obtaining the zone change approval and financing. The goal is to proceed as soon as possible.
- (d) *Preliminary Reviews* – All utilities are available to the site and at adequate capacities. The owner has been coordinating the infrastructure issues with MSD, GCWW and other City departments. To ensure that all proposed infrastructure is sufficient, Planning Staff will circulate a copy of the final development plan upon submission to the necessary City departments.
- (e) *Density and Open Space* – Sufficient open space will be provided throughout the development. (See attached site plan)
- (f) *Other Information* – The required parking spaces will be provided within the development as outlined in the Development Program Statement. (See attached)

PLANS:

There are no existing Plans that encompass or make reference to this property.

FINDINGS:

Community Response: As stated above there are several neighboring property owners in opposition to this zone change and development who attended the various zoning staff conferences. The Bond Hill Community Council is supportive of the zone change.

ANALYSIS:

The 16.75 acres of land at St. Aloysius has featured the main orphanage building surrounded by undeveloped green space since the mid 19th century. This institution has a long history in Bond Hill and they wish to remain in Bond Hill. Finances have forced the institution to find ways to generate additional income to carry out their mission. Their proposal to market their property as a social

service office park campus that will generate rent accomplishes both of their goals. In the last year two owners of medical office type uses have approached St. Aloysius, one being the American Red Cross, and they were unable to accommodate them because of the ongoing zoning issues. In addition, developers have also approached the institution interested in buying the property to be developed for multi-family residential.

The current appearance of their property, with so much open space, is very unique in Bond Hill. This is the last 16 acres left, from the original 88 acres that St. Aloysius once owned. It is not practical to expect the property to remain as green space. St. Aloysius is not trying to make a huge profit at the expense of the neighborhood. This is a non-profit organization trying to continue its operations and provide needed services to the community and the City.

The proposed office buildings will be of a similar scale and height of neighboring commercial and manufacturing buildings in the MG and CG-A Zoning District along Reading Road and the Norwood Lateral. This development will be phased over a period of several years. The impact of the traffic generated by this office park development will be far less than the impacts of developing 348 residential units with 696 parking spaces, which could be implemented with the existing zoning.

CITY PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION:

According to Section 1429-11(a) of the Cincinnati Zoning Code, City Planning Commission may recommend approval or conditional approval, with restrictions on the establishment of a PD District on finding that all of the following circumstances apply:

1. The PD concept plan and development program statement are consistent with applicable plans and policies and is compatible with surrounding development;

The development of this site for a social service office park is an appropriate use for property bordering the Lateral and an abutting manufacturing and commercial zone. A sufficient buffer should be installed between the residential district and the new development. This buffer should be a condition of the PD approval.

2. The PD concept plan and development program statement enhance the potential for superior urban design in comparison with the development under the base district regulations that would apply if the plan were not approved;

Development of an attractive, properly landscaped office park is more desirable than a 348 multi-family apartment complex and a large surface parking lot.

3. Deviations from the base district regulations applicable to the property at the time of the PD application are justified by compensating benefits of the PD concept plan and development program statement;

Under the RM - 2.0 zoning district only residential development is permitted, which does not fit the mission of the institution nor would it generate the income necessary to continue operations of St. Aloysius.

4. The PD concept plan and development program statement includes adequate provisions for utility services, refuse collection, landscaping, traffic circulation, building design and preservation.

All aspects are covered in the concept plan as submitted. This issue is also addressed above.

FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN:

Pursuant to Section 1429-13 *Final Development Plan*, a final development plan and program statement would be submitted to City Planning Commission after approval of the concept plan and Planned Development (PD) designation by City Council.

A final development plan must be filed for any portion of an approved concept plan that the applicant wishes to develop and this plan must conform substantially to the approved concept plan and development program statement. The final development plan requirements anticipate changes from the concept plan by requiring significantly more detail. Approval of the final development plan will allow the developer to obtain building permits.

CONCLUSIONS:

1. The re-zoning of 4721 Reading Road to a Planned Development is necessary for St. Aloysius to market their property in order to generate income and continue their mission of serving the community.
2. The applicant, Steve Karoly, has submitted a satisfactory concept plan and development program statement and has successfully met all basic requirements of the Planned Development District.
3. St. Aloysius, the institution, will be able to remain in Bond Hill and continue their nearly 150-year history in the community.
4. A historically significant building will be saved from potential demolition.
5. Currently this property is zoned RM – 2.0 which would allow for 348 multi-family residential units to be developed, which would have substantially more impacts on the community.
6. The new PD zoning increases the marketability and future development of this property.
7. The PD zoning designation will not negatively impact the existing character of the surrounding area.

RECOMMENDATION:

The staff of the City Planning Department recommends the City Planning Commission take the following action:

1. Accept the concept plan for the proposed office park development at 4721 Reading Road with the following conditions:
 - a. A required minimum 20’ buffer must be installed and maintained between the existing residential uses and the new development; and

- b. The owners must work with DOTE city staff to address the traffic issues.
2. Approve a zone change from RM–2.0 Multi-family to a PD Planned Development District at 4721 Reading Road with the findings that the PD is consistent with the following requirement of Section 1429-11:
 - a. The PD concept plan and development program statement are consistent with applicable plans and policies and is compatible with surrounding development;
 - b. The PD concept plan and development program statement enhance the potential for superior urban design in comparison with the development under the base district regulation that would apply if their plan were not approved;
 - c. Deviations from the base district regulations applicable to the property at the time of PD application are justified by compensating benefits of the PD concept plan and development program statement; and
 - d. The PD concept plan and development program statement includes adequate provisions for utility services, refuse collection, open space, landscaping, buffering, pedestrian circulation, traffic circulation, building design and building location.

Respectfully submitted,

APPROVED:

Caroline Hardy Kellam
Senior City Planner

Charles C. Graves III
Director of the City Planning Department

Attachments

DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM STATEMENT

St Aloysius Site Development Plan

September 17, 2007

The 16.75 acre St. Aloysius site located at the intersection of the Norwood Lateral and Reading Road, as indicated in the attached drawing, is currently zoned RM 2.0 – Residential Multi Family. It is desired to achieve a zoning change from RM 2.0 to PD – Plan Development. The details of the future development are shown on the attached drawing. The 16.75 acre site shall be developed as six parcels to support an Expanded Social Service Campus consistent with the history and mission of the St. Aloysius Orphanage organization while maintaining the current services provided by the organization.

Site amenities such as parking, landscape buffers and traffic control will be developed to serve the intended building functions within the parameters of the site.

Implementation of the indicated plan shall be phased over the next ten years. Phase I will begin with the development of parcels 3, 4, & 6. Phase II will complete the project with parcels 1 and 2.

USE GROUPS

1. Medical Services & Clinic
As defined in zoning code 1401-01-M3
“Medical services” and “medical clinic” means offices organized as a unified facility for more than two (2) licensed physicians, dentist, chiropractors, or other health care professionals providing diagnosis or care of sick or injured persons but are not provided with room and board and are not kept overnight on the premises. Medical services and medical clinics include medical and dental laboratories incidental to the medical office.
2. School
As defined in zoning code 1401-01-S
“School” means a facility for educational purposes that offers a general course of study at primary, middle, or high school levels and vocational and trade programs that are incidental to the operation of such schools.
3. Day-Care
As defined in zoning code 1401-01-D
“Day-care center” means an establishment licensed by the State of Ohio providing care and supervision for seven or more persons on a less than 24-hour basis. This classification includes nursery schools, preschools, day care center for children or adults and any other day care facility licensed by the State of Ohio.
Early Childhood development
4. Office
As defined in zoning code 1401-01-O
“Office” means a facility for a firm or organization that primarily provides

professional, executive, management or administrative services, such as accounting, advertising, architectural, city planning, computer software consulting, data management, engineering, medical, dental, chiropractor, or other health care professionals, environmental analysis, insurance, interior design, investment, graphic design, landscape design, law and real estate offices, drafting and recording studios. It excludes medial offices with more than two (2) licensed health care professionals (see 1401-01-M3), banks and savings and loan associations and offices that are incidental to retail, production, storage or other activities..

5. Community Service Facility
As defined in zoning code 1401-01-C14
“Community service facility” means a noncommercial facility established primarily for the benefit and service of the populations of the communities in which they are located, such as YMCA or YWCA facilities, boys and girls clubs and offices of community councils, non-profit civic, religious, welfare or philanthropic organizations.
Counseling offices.
6. Assisted Living
As defined in zoning code 1401-01-A11
“Assisted living’ means an institution, residence or facility licensed by the State of Ohio that provides accommodation and personal assistance to more than three residents who are dependent on the services of others by reason of age and physical or mental impairment, but that is not licensed to provide skilled nursing care.
7. Developmental Disability Dwelling
As defined in zoning code 1401-01-D5
"Developmental disability dwelling" means an establishment licensed by the State of Ohio that is located in a single-family residence and provides accommodation, personal care, habilitation serves and supervision in a family setting for not more than ten residents with a developmental disabilities and employees caring for such residents.

BUFFER YARD

1. Adjoining Residential Districts
(as defined in zoning code section 1423-13-B, office district adjoining a residential district. We have increased the buffer zone from 15'-0" to 20'-0")
 - 20'-0" landscaped buffer zone
 - Number of plants per 50'-0" linear feet of buffer yard
 - Option A
 - 6'-0" screen wall
 - Option B
 - 4'-0" high berm
 - 3'-0" high continuous solid screen (shrubs)
 - (2) 1.5 inch caliper trees every 50'-0"
 - Option C
 - 6'-0" screen wall

- (1) 6'-0" evergreen tree every 50'-0".
- (2) 1.5 caliper tree every 50'-0"
- (1) 2.5 caliper tree every 50'-0"
- All required planting must be permanently maintained in good growing condition and replaced with new plant materials when necessary to ensure continued compliance with applicable landscaping requirements.

BUILDING HEIGHT LIMITATIONS

- a. Building height shall be limited to 45'.
(note: code allows for a 15' variance)

PARKING/VEHICULAR ACCESS DRIVES

1. Parking lots, and vehicular access drives
 - 20'-0" setback when adjoining residential districts.
2. Parking spaces required as defined in zoning code section 1425-19-A.
 - Day care center 2 for every facility
 - Community service facilities 1 for every 100 sq ft
 - Schools
 - High School 1 for every 10 classroom seats
 - Elementary 1 for every 30 classroom seats
 - Medical services and clinics 1 for every 150 sq ft
 - Offices 1 for every 400 sq ft
 - Personal Services 1 for every 250 sq ft
 - Personal Instruction Services 1 for every 250 sq ft
3. Parking lot landscaping as defined in zoning code section 1425-29.
 - Perimeter Landscaping. Parking lots must provide a perimeter landscape area of at least three feet in width. With a continuous solid screen of 30" high.
 - Ground Cover. Ground cover must be installed appropriate to the surface conditions of the area. Grass is the default landscaping material.
 - (1) tree for every 500 sq feet of occupied building area.
 - All required planting must be permanently maintained in good growing condition and replaced with new plant materials when necessary to ensure continued compliance with applicable landscaping requirements.
4. Parking Lot Lighting
 - 25' max pole with flat lens and full cut off shield.

SIGN REGULATIONS

1. Building signs with-in the development:
As defined in zoning code section 1427-33 and 1427-35 – OG District.
2. St Aloysius Orphanage Ground Sign
One ground mounted sign for St Aloysius Orphanage
 - 72 sq ft max.

- 10' high
 - 10' long
 - Externally or internally lite.
3. Development ground sign
Development ground sign at entrance to the development as defined in zoning code section 1427-25.
- Only one ground sign at the entrance to the development will be permitted.
 - A ground sign may not be closer to a lot line or right-of-way than one-half the sign height. Refer to Figure 1427-25-A.
 - Each individual ground sign face counts against the maximum total sign area (see 1427-21) permitted for all signs on a site and against the total area permitted for a ground sign as allowed in each district.