

PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

MONDAY, JUNE 23, 2008

3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Senhauser, Spraul-Schmidt, Fisher, Wallace, Jones, Young and Raser present. Chatterjee and Kreider absent.

MINUTES

The Board unanimously approved the minutes of June 9, 2008, as corrected (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Fisher).

NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION, HYDE PARK METHODIST EPISCOPAL CHURCH, 1345 GRACE AVENUE, HYDE PARK

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented the staff report on a National Register nomination for the Hyde Park Methodist Episcopal Church at 1345 Grace Avenue in Hyde Park. The Ohio Historic Site Preservation Advisory Board will hear the nomination on August 1, 2008. Ms. Cowden said the church meets Criterion C and Criteria Consideration A as an example of American Collegiate Gothic Revival style and a “community church” complex. She said it also represents a refined and notable example of Granger, Lowe and Bollenbacher. She explained staff felt inclusion of a brief paragraph in Section 8 under the “Statement of Significance” summarizing how the church meets Criteria Consideration A will clarify the building’s significance and meet this technical requirement. Ms. Cowden explained staff recommended expanding the period to include the 1965-1966 Education Wing and Chapel by Cellarius and Hilmer. She commented the information could be presented more concisely with greater focus, analysis and clarity. Mr. Jones commented that it seemed appropriate to modify the period of significance to include the wing and chapel and asked if the Ohio Historic Preservation Office (OHPO) would support this revision. Mr. Young asked what the likelihood was that the additions would be included. Ms. Cowden said Barbara Powers at the OHPO indicated staff was amenable to expanding the period of significance but was uncertain that the Ohio Historic Site Preservation Advisory Board would support the change.

[Jeff Raser arrived at 3:07PM]

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously with Mr. Raser abstaining (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Fisher) to take the following actions:

1. Find the Hyde Park Community Methodist Church located at 1345 Grace Avenue in the Hyde Park neighborhood of Cincinnati meets the requirements of Criterion C and Criteria Consideration A for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.
2. Recommend the nomination be revised to state specifically the Hyde Park Community Methodist Church’s eligibility under Criteria Consideration A.
3. Encourage the author to undertake the revisions and corrections outlined in the staff report.
4. Direct staff to forward the Board’s findings regarding this nomination to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office prior to the August 1, 2008 meeting of the Ohio Historic Site Preservation Advisory Board.

**NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION, PINECROFT, THE POWEL CROSLEY, JR.,
ESTATE, 2336 KIPLING AVENUE, MT. AIRY**

Ms. Cowden presented the staff report on a National Register nomination for Pinecroft, the Powel Crosley, Jr. estate at 2336 Kipling Avenue in Mt. Airy. The Ohio Historic Site Preservation Advisory Board will hear the nomination on August 1, 2008. Ms. Cowden said Pinecroft was eligible for the National Register under Criterion B and C. James Dwight Baum designed Pinecroft as a country estate in 1928; it is an excellent example of the Tudor Revival style and representative of a nationwide trend in building country houses in the early 20th century. It was also significant for its association with Powel Crosley, Jr., an inventor, industrialist and entrepreneur.

The Board agreed the nomination was well organized and written. The Board did suggest that it would be helpful if all the photographs, current and historic, were numbered and keyed to a site or floor plan.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Raser) to take the following actions:

1. Find the nomination for Pinecroft, the Powel Crosley, Jr. Estate, located at 2336 Kipling Avenue does sufficiently demonstrate that this property meets the requirement of Criteria B and C for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.
2. Direct staff to forward the Board's findings regarding this nomination to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office prior to the August 1, 2008 meeting of the Ohio Historic Site Preservation Advisory Board.

**PRELIMINARY DESIGN REVIEW, 427 PLUM STREET, WEST FOURTH STREET
HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Ms. Cowden presented a staff report for a Preliminary Design Review at 427 Plum Street in the West Fourth Street Historic District. She explained this was a rehabilitation project for a veterinary practice for Dr. Biederman on the two lower floors and his residence on the two upper floors. The proposal included repair or in-kind replacement of exterior metalwork and the installation of new windows and a storefront in the main (east) façade. Stephen Lykins of LG Tokarsky & Associates was seeking direction from the Board before proceeding with the design work.

Mr. Senhauser questioned whether the existing two-over-two windows were original. Ms. Cowden commented that commercial/light industrial buildings in Cincinnati typically have multi-light metal sash, but a nearby commercial building within the district at the northwest corner of McFarland and Plum Streets also had two-over-two wood sash. Mr. Lykins indicated that the windows were in relatively decent condition, too good to be original to a late 19th century building. Mr. Young disagreed; pointing out that the Hale-Justis building on Central Parkway had similar if not identical windows. The stops, pulls, trim and other visible details were in keeping with the building's period of construction and the windows were likely original.

In response to Mr. Senhauser, Mr. Lykins said the proposed windows were manufactured by Pella. The Pella windows will have a much higher R-value and will cost less than repairing the existing sash, replacing the float glass and upgrading the HVAC system. Mr. Lykins stated that Dr. Biederman was confined to a wheelchair and his ability to open the windows easily from a seated position was a factor in choosing to replace them. Even if they could be repaired, Mr. Lykins did not believe Dr. Biederman would be able to open the existing weighted windows.

Board members generally agreed that although the sills were in poor condition, the sash itself appeared to be in good condition and could likely be repaired. Replacing the existing two-over-two windows with pairs of one-over-one Pella windows represented a fairly significant change. The applicant was encouraged to explore retaining the existing windows and other alternatives, including Marvin Magnum windows and awnings, that more sympathetically replicated the horizontal and vertical divisions of the existing windows. The Board emphasized that the applicant would need to provide cost estimates for repairing the existing wood windows and any proposed replacements.

The Board inquired if there was any documentation of the original storefront. Ms. Cowden stated that no photographs or drawings had been located. Ms. Lykins added that the interior had been entirely modified, leaving no physical evidence of an earlier storefront. The new storefront was designed as a modern, clearly contemporary feature.

Mr. Raser asked if the storefront had to have two entrances. Mr. Lykins responded affirmatively, indicating that one of the two entrances will provide emergency fire egress for an adjacent building while the other will open into the lobby of Dr. Biederman's veterinarian practice. In response to Mr. Jones, Mr. Lykins said the storefront would not have blinds or shades. The Board had no issue with removing the existing storefront. However, several Board members expressed reservations regarding the number of divided lights in the proposed storefront and suggested the applicant simplify the design.

The Board asked if any thought had been given to signage. Mr. Lykins said that signage for Dr. Biederman's business had not yet been finalized. Although signage was not included in the proposal, Board members noted that the location of 427 Plum and the simplicity of the building offered copious options for signage and suggested that it be integrated into the storefront.

BOARD ACTION

No official Board action was required.

ADJOURN

As there were no other items to be considered by the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 4:00PM.

Adrienne Cowden
Interim Urban Conservator

John C. Senhauser, Chairman

Date: _____